Report on Activities

Convention on Conventional Weapons Group of Governmental Experts meeting on lethal autonomous weapons systems & Meeting of High Contracting Parties
United Nations Geneva
November 2017
Table of Contents

About this report ........................................................................................................................................... 1

Overview ......................................................................................................................................................... 2
  1. Agreement on future work .......................................................................................................................... 2
  2. Lead-up to the CCW Group of Governmental Experts Meeting ............................................................... 4
  3. CCW Group of Governmental Experts Meeting ....................................................................................... 4
  4. Work of the CCW Annual Meeting of High Contracting Parties ......................................................... 7
  5. Campaign activities .................................................................................................................................. 7

Annex I: Country Views on Killer Robots ....................................................................................................... 10

Annex II: 2017 UNGA First Committee Round-Up ....................................................................................... 14

Annex III: Campaign Delegation .................................................................................................................. 24
About this report
This report details activities by the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots at the Convention on Conventional Weapons (CCW) at the United Nations in Geneva in November 2017, specifically the first meeting of the CCW Group of Governmental Experts on lethal autonomous weapons systems on 13-17 November and the CCW’s annual Meeting of High Contracting Parties held the following week.

The report records the campaign’s contributions, reviews the participation of governments in these meetings, and comments on the final outcome. Its annexes contain country views, UNGA statement extracts, our delegation list and a round-up of media coverage.

Campaign coordinator Mary Wareham of Human Rights Watch prepared this report, drawing from statements posted online by the CCW implementation support unit and WILPF’s Reaching Critical Will Project. The report also draws on notes of the deliberations taken by Bonnie Docherty of Human Rights Watch and her students Alicia Brudney and Sofia Falzoni at Harvard Law School’s International Human Rights Clinic and by Ray Acheson for WILPF’s Reaching Critical Will Project.

Human Rights Watch intern Jacob Ware helped to compile this report and assemble the annex of impressive media coverage.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots is grateful for the generous donor support that enabled us to have a strong presence at the CCW meetings and to conduct outreach in the lead-up and afterwards.

This report is available on the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots website at: www.stopkillerrobots.org/statements

Washington DC
26 February 2018
Overview

1. Agreement on future work
At the Convention on Conventional Weapons (CCW) annual meeting in November 2017, nations agreed to a mandate to continue the CCW Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) on lethal autonomous weapons systems (LAWS) in 2018 by meeting twice. The decision came from a recommendation from the first meeting of the CCW’s Group of Governmental Experts on LAWS on 13-17 November 2017 and is contained in the final report of the Meeting of High Contracting Parties adopted on 24 November 2017:¹

The Group of Governmental Experts related to emerging technologies in the area of lethal autonomous weapons systems (LAWS) in the context of the objectives and purposes of the Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons shall meet for a duration of ten days in 2018 in Geneva in accordance with Decision 1 of the Fifth Review Conference of the High Contracting Parties to the Convention (CCW/CONF.V/10), consistent with CCW/CONF.V/2.

The Rules of Procedure of the Review Conference shall apply mutatis mutandis to the Group. The Group shall conduct its work and adopt its report by consensus which shall be submitted to the 2018 Meeting of the High Contracting Parties to the Convention. The widest possible participation of all High Contracting Parties is to be promoted in accordance with the goals of the CCW Sponsorship Programme.

The Group will continue to be chaired by Ambassador Amandeep Singh Gill of India without prejudice to the principle of geographical rotation.

Two meetings have been scheduled on 2018: the second meeting of the GGE on 9-13 April and third on 27-31 August. The annual Meeting of High Contracting Parties will be held on 21-23 November.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots has welcomed the decision to continue the CCW process on lethal autonomous weapons systems, but regrets its lack of urgency and a desired outcome.² More substantive talks in 2018 should lead to the negotiation by the end of 2019 of a new CCW protocol banning the development, production, and use of fully autonomous weapons. Past CCW Groups of Governmental Experts have led to the negotiations of protocols, such as the CCW’s 1995 protocol that preemptively banned blinding lasers.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots identified three priorities for its desired outcome from the CCW meetings in November 2017:

---
1. More time is dedicated to the CCW deliberations in 2018 by holding at least four weeks of GGE meetings, including during the first half of the year;  
2. The long list of topics contained in the GGE mandate agreed by the Fifth Review Conference is retained and states commit to identify options for CCW action, including their preferred outcome;  
3. All participating states acknowledge the need for international regulation to address autonomy in the critical functions of weapon systems and elaborate their position on the call to prohibit systems that are fully autonomous/lack meaningful human control.

There was mixed success with the first objective. Few states made the case for more time to be dedicated to the CCW process on killer robots in 2018 beyond two weeks due mainly to concerns over finances. But significant effort was made to schedule the 2018 meetings earlier in the year. After the campaign criticized CCW states for merely rolling over the previously agreed mandate and described 2017 as a “lost year” for international diplomacy on killer robots concerns, four CCW officeholders for 2018 issued a 2-page message on 22 December notifying states that the first GGE meeting for 2018 would be rescheduled to 19-23 February. However, on 11 January 2018, the GGE chair Ambassador Amandeep Singh Gill announced that, after confirming the availability of rooms and finances, they will revert to the original schedule agreed by states last year and hold the first GGE meeting on 9-13 April after all.

The second objective was achieved as the mandate for 2018 deliberations remains based on the original GGE mandate agreed by the 2016 Review Conference decision. The most heavily negotiated section of the 2017 GGE meeting report concerned the conclusions that identified three main areas of work for 2018: 1) discuss characterization of the systems under consideration in order to promote a common understanding on concepts and characteristics relevant to lethal autonomous weapons systems; 2) assess the aspects of human-machine interaction in the development, deployment and use of emerging technologies in the area of lethal autonomous weapons systems; and 3) identify “possible options for addressing the humanitarian and international security challenges posed by emerging technologies in the area of lethal autonomous weapons systems in the context of the objectives and purposes of the Convention without prejudging policy outcomes and taking into account past, present and future proposals.”

The third objective was realized to a certain extent. During the November 2017 meetings, Brazil, Iraq, and Uganda expressed support for a ban on lethal autonomous weapons systems, pushing the list of ban states to 22. On the other hand, Israel, Russia, the UK, and the US expressed strong opposition to discussing politically binding measures, let alone legally binding ones. A new position articulated by Venezuela for the Non-Aligned Movement, with more than 100 member states, means that most states now see a need to move swiftly develop new international law on fully autonomous weapons. Nearly all states that spoke accepted that some form of human control must be maintained over weapons systems.

This report details activities by the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots since December 2016, covering the period leading-up to and including the November 2017 CCW meetings.

---

3 See “CCW key milestones in 2018” issued by the representatives of Latvia, India, France and Iraq and dated 24 December 2017.  
2. Lead-up to the CCW Group of Governmental Experts Meeting

In December 2016 at their Review Conference, states formalized the CCW process on killer robots by creating the Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) and assigned Ambassador Amandeep Singh Gill to chair it, doubling the period of time for the meeting to two weeks compared to previous years.

Yet problems quickly arose. The initial meeting scheduled for 24-28 April 2017 was postponed until August and then cancelled altogether by CCW president Ambassador Matthew Rowland of the UK, who issued several warnings that that a lack of payments of assessed financial contributions would require the cancellation of planned meetings. At that time, Brazil accounted for vast majority of CCW debts and had not paid any dues since 2010. The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots appealed to Brazil to pay the funds it owed without delay and it did so later in the year, enabling the GGE meeting to finally take place held on 13-17 November.

In October 2017, concerns over killer robots once again featured prominently at the UN General Assembly (UNGA) First Committee on Disarmament and International Security in New York for the fifth consecutive year. A total of 34 states raised killer robots in their statements, down two from the 2016 session, with most expressed support for continued work at the CCW. Two states—Burkina Faso and Myanmar—spoke on the matter for the first time.

3. CCW Group of Governmental Experts Meeting

A total of 86 countries participated in the first GGE meeting on lethal autonomous weapons systems on 13-17 November, in addition to UNIDIR, the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC), three dozen representatives from the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots, and several academics.

The GGE meeting opened with statements from the chair and from the new director of the Geneva Branch of the UN Office of Disarmament Affairs, Anja Kaspersen, on behalf of the High Representative for Disarmament Affairs. After adopting the agenda and confirming the rules of procedure and organization of work of the meeting, 49 countries and the Non-Aligned Movement (delivered by Venezuela) made statements in a general exchange of views that took up the rest of the morning as well as Wednesday morning. Other speakers included the European Union, UN Institute for Disarmament Research (UNIDIR), International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC), the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots and four of its NGO co-founders.4

During the general debate, Brazil and Iraq for the first time called for a ban on lethal autonomous weapons systems, bringing the total number of countries seeking this objective to 21. Ban endorsers Chile, Costa Rica, Cuba, Holy See, Pakistan, and Panama reiterated their calls for a prohibition. Venezuela spoke on behalf of the Non-Aligned Group (NAM) of states and made a strong pitch on behalf of NAM to start negotiating new international law on lethal autonomous weapons systems.

4 These countries spoke in the GGE meeting’s general debate: Algeria, Argentina, Australia, Austria, Belgium, Brazil, Bulgaria, Cambodia, Canada, Chile, China, Costa Rica, Croatia, Cuba, Egypt, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Holy See, India, Iraq, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Japan, Kazakhstan, Mexico, Morocco, Netherlands, New Zealand, Nicaragua, Norway, Pakistan, Panama, Peru, Republic of Korea, Russia, Sierra Leone, South Africa, Spain, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, United Kingdom, United States, Venezuela, and Zambia.
weapons systems. Brazil remarked, that “there is enough critical mass now to move to a more structured approach by developing a new legally binding instrument.”

In contrast, Israel, Russia, Turkey, United Kingdom, and United States reiterated their opposition to a ban. The US and the UK indicated it is “too early” to support a prohibition, while Israel said the “futuristic nature” and differing opinions on these weapons mean a careful and incremental approach is most useful way forward. A Franco-German proposal for the CCW to produce a non-binding political declaration and code of conduct next year received support from the EU, Belgium, Spain, and Switzerland. Cambodia expressed its views on killer robots for the first time and suggested the CCW focus next on working definitions.

Most states agree that a useful next step would be for the CCW to discuss a working definition of lethal autonomous weapon systems, as well as concepts such as meaningful or adequate human control. Several states shared their concept of a lethal autonomous weapons system, including Norway, which said it generally regards as a weapon system that can “search for, identify, and engage targets using lethal force without human intervention.”

On Monday afternoon, a series of panels began with invited experts to examine “various dimensions of emerging technologies in the area of lethal autonomous weapons systems.” The first “technology dimension” panel featured three experts from the UK, and one each from India, South Africa, and the US. While the chair sought to promote discussion of broader issues raised by emerging technologies, both the panelists and audience of states including Brazil, Cuba, France, Russia, Sierra Leone, and Sweden kept returning to the specific challenges raised by lethal autonomous weapons systems. Two expert speakers said that a ban could be verified in a similar fashion to the Chemical Weapons Convention, in cooperation with industry. In general, the panelists also seemed to agree that a ban would not interfere with other uses of the technology. Sean Legassick affirmed DeepMind’s institutional support for a ban, arguing that no weapon should be deployed without human control given the unconstrained environment of armed conflict and potential for unforeseen circumstances.

A second panel on Tuesday morning considered the “military effects dimension” and featured two experts from the US, and one each from France, Japan, Republic of Korea and the UK. The discussion after the panel presentations ranged from questions about the scope of the technologies under consideration to the tactical, strategic, and operational challenges posed by lethal autonomous weapons systems.

Egypt, Sierra Leone, and a representative from the University of Birmingham questioned one panelist’s assertion that autonomous weapons would result in less “collateral damage” (aka humanitarian harm, civilian casualties). Uganda and Pakistan expressed concerns about proliferation and a potential arms race. Brazil, Ireland, and Switzerland all expressed concern about efforts to limit the conversation only to future technologies. They all noted the benefits of considering all emerging technologies with some degree of autonomy, with Switzerland noting that such technologies will help determine how systems can comply with international humanitarian law. China, Japan, Russia, and Sweden also asked questions and/or made interventions following the panel.
The third panel, on Tuesday afternoon, looked at the “legal/ethical dimension” with experts from Belgium, Russia, Switzerland, US, ICRC, and UNESCO. Marie-Helen Parizeau presented the findings of UNESCO’s World Commission on the Ethics of Scientific Knowledge and Technology or “COMEST” which emphasized the need to retain human control over weapon systems and use of force because the moral responsibility of taking human life cannot be delegated to a machine, because this would violate human dignity and devalue all human life.

In the discussion that followed the panel, states raised several questions about transparency in national-level weapon reviews and the sufficiency of existing international law. The following states spoke during the discussion: Brazil, Estonia, China, France, Japan, Netherlands, Russia, Switzerland, US

After returning to and concluding the general debate on Wednesday morning, Ambassador Gill then held an “interactive discussion” inviting comments on his three-page “food-for-thought” working paper and its broad questions on the technological, military, and legal/ethical implications of emerging technologies in the area of lethal autonomous weapons systems. States provided nine working papers in advance of the meeting, including Russia and the US for the first time.5

Sixteen delegations spoke during the discussion of the Chair’s paper.6 States including Algeria, Argentina, Chile, Cuba, Egypt, and Pakistan, again reiterated their support for a ban, while others, such as France and Germany, argued that a prohibition is premature. The United States said it does not support the development of a politically-binding or legally-binding agreement at this time.

On Thursday morning, Ambassador Gill requested views on the way ahead and then presented his draft report of the meeting to states. In total, 35 countries, as well as NAM and International Committee of the Red Cross spoke during the debate on the way ahead.7 Uganda became the 22nd state to endorse the goal of prohibiting lethal autonomous weapons systems. A majority of states reiterated the need for concrete action, although China, Japan, Latvia, Republic of Korea, Russia, and US maintained their opposition to any action on lethal autonomous weapons systems at this stage. Chile, Nicaragua, Panama, Peru, and NAM expressed support for a moratorium on autonomous weapons, pending a more comprehensive ban.

Friday morning opened with a “cross-cutting” panel on various dimensions of emerging technologies in the area of lethal autonomous weapon systems featuring two experts from US and experts from Germany, International Telecommunications Union, SIPRI, and UNIDIR.

5 Only states are allowed to submit CCW working papers, which are available online. Nine states provided working papers for the 2017 meeting in addition to the chair: Belgium, Germany and France, Netherlands, Netherlands and Switzerland, Russia, Switzerland, US (two papers) and Venezuela for the Non-Aligned Movement and other CCW states parties.

6 These countries spoke during the session on the chair’s food-for-thought paper: Algeria, Argentina, Brazil, Chile, China, Cuba, Egypt, France, Germany, Japan, Netherlands, Pakistan, Panama, Russia, Switzerland, and US.

7 These countries spoke in the debate on the way ahead: Algeria, Argentina, Australia, Austria, Belgium, Brazil, Canada, Chile, China, Costa Rica, Cuba, Estonia, Ireland, Italy, Japan, Kazakhstan, Latvia, Mexico, Netherlands, New Zealand, Nicaragua, Panama, Pakistan, Palestine, Peru, Poland, Republic of Korea, Russia, Sierra Leone, Spain, Sri Lanka, Switzerland, Uganda, UK, and US.
On Friday afternoon, the Chair released an amended version of the draft report of the meeting, as well as his summary of the discussions. Most states expressed dissatisfaction with the lack of ambition presented in the draft report and the lack of urgency expressed. The Chair said from a national perspective he shares this disappointment but argued that it can sharpen the focus for next year’s discussion and said that policy directions can be discussed next year.

States finally adopted by consensus at approximately 7:00pm that evening.

4. Work of the CCW Annual Meeting of High Contracting Parties

UK Ambassador Matthew Rowland served as president of the CCW Meeting of States Parties in 2017. He opened the meeting on 22 November with a general debate during which nearly all 54 states that spoke commented on lethal autonomous weapons systems.8

During the Meeting of States Parties, Ambassador Gill presented the GGE report and its recommended mandate for continued work in 2018. None of the 21 states that spoke in the subsequent exchange indicated they would oppose the proposed mandate.9

After a lengthy debate over financing and other matters, states adopted their final report of the annual meeting, including the decision to continue the GGE on lethal autonomous weapons systems in 2018, at approximately 8:20pm on Friday, 24 November.

Latvia’s permanent representative Ambassador Jānis Kārkliņš will serve as president of the CCW’s next Meeting of High Contracting Parties on 21-23 November 2018.

5. Campaign activities

After the December 2016 CCW Review Conference, the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots spent the first three-quarters of 2017 intensifying its outreach in capitals and raising the profile of this issue in other international fora. These activities are detailed on the campaign website.

For the fifth consecutive year in a row, the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots conducted significant outreach at the UNGA First Committee on Disarmament and International Security in New York and made a statement expressing regret at the faltering diplomatic process.10 During the 2017 UNGA First Committee, campaigners met with UN disarmament chief Izumi Nakamitsu and with country delegations such as France, Germany and New Zealand. The campaign held a steering

---

8 The states spoke in the general debate of the CCW Meeting of High Contracting Parties: Algeria, Austria, Australia, Argentina, Brazil, Belarus, Belgium, Bulgaria, Cameroon, Canada, Chile, China, Costa Rica, Croatia, Cuba, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Holy See, India, Iraq, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Japan, Latvia, Lebanon, Mexico, Morocco, Myanmar, Netherlands, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Panama, Paraguay, Philippines, Republic of Korea, Romania, Russia, Slovakia, South Africa, Spain, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, Ukraine, UK, US, Venezuela, and Zambia as well as Venezuela on behalf of the Non-Aligned Movement, European Union, UNMAS, ICRC, Article 36 and the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots.

9 The following delegations participated in the discussion on this matter: Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Costa Rica, Cuba, France, Germany, Israel, Italy, Japan, Mexico, Pakistan, Panama, Philippines, Poland, Republic of Korea, Russia, Spain, UK, and US plus Venezuela on behalf of the Non-Aligned Movement.

committee meeting at the New School on 16 October. The campaign coordinator provided an update for activists attending the annual Humanitarian Disarmament Forum on 14-15 October.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots held a UNGA First Committee briefing together with the Permanent Mission of Mexico emphasizing the need for states to overcome challenges facing the faltering diplomatic process by moving swiftly to develop new international law on fully autonomous weapons.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots delegation to the November 2017 CCW meetings consisted of more than two-dozen representatives from Canada, Colombia, Egypt, Japan, the Netherlands, South Africa, Switzerland, UK, and US. (See Annex III) The campaign coordinator met regularly with Ambassador Gill and his team in the lead-up to the 2017 GGE meeting and since then. During the November 2017 CCW meetings, campaign representatives held substantive meetings with delegations from countries including Austria, Belgium, France, Germany, Holy See, Japan, Netherlands, New Zealand, Pakistan, Russia, South Africa, UK, US, and Zimbabwe.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots convened two side event briefings during the November 2017 CCW meetings. The first one, on Monday, 13 November, provided the rationale for banning fully autonomous weapons and presented new research prepared by campaign members. Stuart Russell of the University of California at Berkeley screened the new 7:47-minute Slaughterbots video produced by Future of Life Institute and promoted its new website: http://autonomousweapons.org/. Toby Walsh of the University of New South Wales gave introductory remarks, highlighting the new open letters calling for a ban that more than 120 Australian AI and robotics experts sent to Prime Minister Malcolm Turnbull and more than 135 Canadian AI and robotics experts gave to Prime Minister Justin Trudeau.

Denise Garcia presented a new “frequently asked questions” handout produced by ICRAC. Daan Kayser presented two new PAX reports: ‘Where to draw the line’ by Frank Slijper documents the trend towards increasing autonomy in weapon systems and ‘Keeping control’ by Daan provides an overview of the positions of European states on lethal autonomous weapon systems. Richard Moyes presented a new briefing note by Article 36 on evaluating ‘meaningful human control’ in weapons review processes: Ara Marcen Naval from Amnesty International commented on human rights and autonomous weapons, particularly the likelihood of use by law enforcement.

At the second side event briefing on 22 November, Nobel Peace Laureate Jody Williams of the Nobel Women’s Initiative, Steve Goose of Human Rights Watch and ICRAC’s Noel Sharkey provided the campaign’s assessment of the first GGE meeting and its recommendations on the way forward to a ban.

Media interest in the CCW meetings began in earnest on 6 November with the publication of the letters from AI experts to the prime ministers of Australia and Canada. A 10 November wire story by Agence France Presse (AFP) provided a helpful lead-in to GGE with quotes from the GGE

chair and Campaign to Stop Killer Robots coordinator. On 17 November, the campaign coordinator and representatives from Human Rights Watch and ICRAC briefed members of the UN Geneva correspondents’ association (ACANU). The Slaughterbots video was central in generating a slew of media coverage throughout the two weeks of CCW meetings. (See Annex IV)

Campaign co-founder WILPF’s Reaching Critical Will published six editions of its CCW Report newsletter for distribution to CCW delegates. The campaign published web post before the GGE meeting and at the end, in addition to another following the conclusion of the 2018 Meeting of High Contracting Parties.

For more information, please see:
- CCW 2017 GGE website, audio recordings
- WILPF Reaching Critical Will CCW 2017 website
- Campaign to Stop Killer Robots website and Flickr site (photos)
- Mines Action Canada daily Storify and YouTube updates
Annex I: Country Views on Killer Robots

26 February 2018

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots monitors developments with respect to national policy to address concerns over fully autonomous weapons, including positions on the call to ban these weapons.

Who has called for a ban on killer robots?

Twenty-two countries are calling for a ban on lethal autonomous weapons systems

In alphabetical order:

1. Algeria
2. Argentina
3. Bolivia
4. Brazil
5. Chile
6. Costa Rica
7. Cuba
8. Ecuador
9. Egypt
10. Ghana
11. Guatemala
12. Holy See
13. Iraq
14. Mexico
15. Nicaragua
16. Pakistan
17. Panama
18. Peru
19. State of Palestine
20. Uganda
21. Venezuela
22. Zimbabwe

In chronological order:
- Pakistan on 30 May 2013
- Ecuador on 13 May 2014
- Egypt on 13 May 2014
- Holy See on 13 May 2014
- Cuba on 16 May 2014
- Ghana on 16 April 2015
- Bolivia on 17 April 2015
- State of Palestine on 13 November 2015
Zimbabwe on 12 November 2015
Algeria on 11 April 2016
Costa Rica on 11 April 2016
Mexico on 13 April 2016
Chile on 14 April 2016
Nicaragua on 14 April 2016
Panama on 12 December 2016
Peru on 12 December 2016
Argentina on 12 December 2016
Venezuela on 13 December 2016
Guatemala on 13 December 2016
Brazil on 13 November 2017
Iraq on 13 November 2017
Uganda on 17 November 2017

Who has spoken on the topic of killer robots?


1. Algeria on 30 May 2013
2. Argentina on 30 May 2013
3. Australia on 14 November 2013
4. Austria on 30 May 2013
5. Bangladesh on 21 October 2016
6. Belarus on 14 November 2013
7. Belgium on 11 November 2013
8. Bolivia on 17 April 2015
10. Brazil on 30 May 2013
11. Bulgaria on 23 October 2014
12. Burkina Faso on 23 October 2017
13. Cambodia on 13 November 2017
15. Canada on 11 November 2013
16. Chile on 13 April 2015
17. China on 30 May 2013
18. Colombia on 17 April 2015
19. Costa Rica on 29 October 2013
20. Croatia on 15 November 2013
21. Cuba on 30 May 2013
22. Czech Republic on 13 May 2014
23. Denmark on 13 April 2015
24. Ecuador on 29 October 2013
25. Egypt on 30 May 2013
26. Estonia on 31 August 2016
27. Finland on 22 October 2014
28. France on 30 May 2013
29. Germany on 30 May 2013
30. Ghana on 14 November 2013
31. Greece on 29 October 2013
32. Guatemala on 16 May 2014
33. Holy See on 14 November 2013
34. Hungary on 7 October 2016
35. India on 30 October 2013
36. Indonesia on 30 May 2013
37. Iran on 30 May 2013
38. Iraq on 13 November 2015
39. Ireland on 29 October 2013
40. Israel on 15 November 2013
41. Italy on 14 November 2013
42. Japan on 29 October 2013
43. Jordan on 31 August 2016
44. Kazakhstan on 13 November 2015
45. Kuwait on 26 October 2015
46. Latvia on 21 October 2016
47. Lebanon on 26 October 2015
48. Lithuania on 14 November 2013
49. Madagascar on 14 November 2013
50. Mali on 13 May 2014
51. Mexico on 30 May 2013
52. Moldova, Rep. on 12 December 2016
53. Montenegro on 12 December 2016
54. Morocco on 30 May 2013
55. Myanmar on 10 October 2017
56. Netherlands on 29 October 2013
57. New Zealand on 30 October 2013
58. Nicaragua on 13 November 2015
59. Norway on 13 May 2014
60. Pakistan on 30 May 2013
61. Palestine on 13 November 2014
62. Panama on 12 December 2016
63. Peru on 12 December 2016
64. Philippines on 14 April 2016
65. Poland on 13 April 2015
66. Portugal on 14 October 2014
67. Romania on 26 October 2015
68. Russia on 30 May 2013
69. Sierra Leone on 30 May 2013
70. Slovakia on 12 December 2016
71. Slovenia on 12 December 2016
72. South Africa on 30 October 2013
73. South Korea on 14 November 2013
74. Spain on 11 November 2013
75. Sri Lanka on 13 April 2015
76. Sweden on 30 May 2013
77. Switzerland on 30 May 2013
78. Turkey on 14 November 2013
79. Ukraine on 14 November 2013
80. United Kingdom on 30 May 2013
81. United States on 30 May 2013
82. Venezuela on 13 December 2016
83. Zambia on 17 April 2015
84. Zimbabwe on 12 November 2015
Annex II: 2017 UNGA First Committee Round-Up
October 2017

In October 2017, 34 countries articulated their views on killer robots during the annual session of the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) First Committee on Disarmament and International Security: Algeria, Argentina, Bangladesh, Botswana, Burkina Faso, Canada, China, Costa Rica, Cuba, Ecuador, Egypt, Finland, France, Germany, Hungary, India, Ireland, Kazakhstan, Japan, Lebanon, Myanmar, Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Pakistan, Philippines, Portugal, Russia, Slovenia, South Africa, South Korea, Switzerland, United Kingdom, and United States. In addition, statements were made by the European Union, Non-Aligned Movement, Nordic Countries, International Committee of the Red Cross, and Campaign to Stop Killer Robots. The extracts follow.

Previously, 36 countries commented on killer robots during the 2016 session of the UNGA First Committee Disarmament and International Security, while 32 did so in 2015, 23 in 2014, and 16 in 2013.

Burkina Faso and Myanmar provided their views on fully autonomous weapons for the first time. Algeria, Cuba, and Pakistan again expressed their support for a ban on killer robots, while a number of states expressed support for the GGE and excitement for upcoming meetings.

Extracts from statements to 2017 UNGA First Committee

Algeria (23 October)
“The use of artificial intelligence holds the promise of a bright future. However, the use of AI to develop lethal autonomous weapons system poses great challenges. The international community must adopt clear laws. We welcome the decision on the Fifth Review Conference of the CCW to address these important issues.”

Argentina (23 October)
“Argentina considers that the CCW offers the right framework to negotiate new instruments dealing with other weapons which are not yet fully regulated from a humanitarian point of view, such as lethal autonomous weapons systems.”

Bangladesh (18 October)
“Bangladesh appreciates the outcome of the Fifth Review Conference of the CCW held in Geneva last year. We welcome the decision to establish of an open-ended Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) related to the emerging technologies in the area of lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) in the context of the objectives and purpose of CCW. We look forward to substantive outcomes from the GGE’s deliberations.”

Botswana (23 October)
“Botswana reiterates its support for the work of the 5th Review Conference to the “Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons” (CCW). We welcome with appreciation, the appointment of a Group of Governmental Expert who will amongst others
examine challenges related to emerging technologies in the area of Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS).”

**Burkina Faso (23 October)**
“The search for durable solutions to the emergence of new challenges resulting from fully autonomous weapons systems is essential for all. Our individual security is guaranteed only when the so-called collective security is ensured, then, let us combine our efforts to build peaceful societies and thus to preserve the future generations from threats related to the proliferation of conventional arms.”

**Canada (20 October)**
“Canada will participate in the Group of Governmental Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems under the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons. A deeper understanding of the multi-faceted issues these weapons present is needed in the international community. In order for important planned meetings, such as those on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems, to take place it is imperative that the Convention’s financial situation be stabilized.”

**China (20 October)**
“In recent years, the humanitarian concerns caused by Lethal Autonomous Weapon System (LAWS) have caused the attention of the international community. China is of the view that countries should abide by the UN Charter and armed conflict law while using LAWS, respect the sovereignty and territorial integrity of other countries, and attach importance to the humanitarian consequences and other issues possibly caused by these weapons. China supports and will participate actively in the discussions on LAWS within the framework of CCW.”

**Costa Rica (18 October)**
“We must also address the ethical, legal and technical concerns that have arisen raising with regard to the systems of lethal autonomous weapons, which are in our view, contrary to international humanitarian law and international human rights law. We expect substantive discussions on 105 challenges in this context, in the following meeting of the Governmental Group of Experts within the framework of the Convention on Conventional Weapons. – Google translation

**Cuba (20 October)**
“We call for the adoption, as soon as possible, of a Protocol prohibiting lethal autonomous weapons, also called “killer robots,” before large scale begins to occur.”

**Ecuador (20 October)**
“My country believes that the international community must continue the debate about unmanned aerial vehicles and lethal autonomous weapons systems. The use of these new bellicose technologies brings with it serious humanitarian concerns, the international community in its various regional forums and must continue to deepen the implications they bring for international humanitarian law, including providing for the prohibition of such weapons. We regret budgetary reasons have not been met by the Experts on lethal autonomous weapons. We hope that this situation, with the all 105 States, can be solved.”

**Egypt (19 October)**
“Egypt acknowledges the need for the United Nations to launch as early as possible objective discussions on the ethical, humanitarian, legal, and technical aspects surrounding the issue of lethal autonomous weapons.”

**Finland** (5 October)

“… new technology is changing the global political environment. Science and technology, internet, social media, space and cyber technology, and artificial intelligence have immense positive impact on life everywhere. At the same time we need to look seriously into how these affect international security and arms control. The development of lethal autonomous weapons opens up a totally new perspective on warfare. This poses difficult questions about ethics, regulation and international rules.”

**France** (4 October)

“The international community also needs to mobilize more, with the support of civil society, to enhance compliance with international humanitarian law and achieve progress in the concrete implementation and universalization of existing instruments. … It also applies to the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons, which has been bolstered by the positive outcome of the latest Review Conference, including on the prospective issue of lethal autonomous weapons systems and on improvised explosive devices. My country will continue giving its full backing and necessary expertise to progress on these subjects.”

**France** – II (18 October)

“The CCW Review Conference was held in November 2016. This Convention is unique in the multilateral landscape because it brings together complementary expertise, be it political, legal, military, or diplomatic. This specificity of the CCW is a guarantee of the Convention’s ability to address current and future challenges. The fact that CCW States Parties are dealing with the issue of lethal autonomous weapons systems, as proposed by France in 2013, is a significant development with regard to the Convention. France supports the continuation of dialogue on the issues relating to these future systems, and was pleased to see agreement at the Review Conference of November 2016 to establish a Group of governmental experts with a discussion mandate. France, [together with Germany, has formulated substantive proposals which contribute to the GGE’s work. We] hopes that substantial progress will be made under the CCW.” – Official translation

**Germany** (2 October)

“I would also like to draw on an emerging issue of great importance: Lethal autonomous weapons systems. As the speed of technological progress increases, it is high time to finally tackle this issue. We see a strong need for discussing policy-guidelines and best-practices designed to ensure future weapons systems are in full compliance with international law and we look forward to contributing actively to the Group of Governmental Experts in November.”

**Germany** – II (18 October)

“The CCW’s work on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) has been extremely useful over the past years. In order to further contribute to an informed debate of the GGE we established the independent Scientific International Panel on the Regulation of Autonomous Weapons
We invite parties to a second briefing on the Panel’s work on 25th October to the German House.”

Hungary (5 October)
“We attach high importance to the Amended Protocol II and in particular to the issue of improvised explosive devices as well as to the work of governmental experts on lethal autonomous weapons systems.”

India (9 October)
“The Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons or the CCW is an important and valuable instrument. India welcomes the outcome of the Fifth Review Conference held in 2016, including the decision to establish an open-ended Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) related to emerging technologies in the area of Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems in the context of the objectives and purposes of the Convention. In my capacity as Chair of the GGE, I am pleased with the consultations that are preceding it and I look forward to a stimulating discussion next month in Geneva, which should lay the ground for further progress. A continued substantive mandate, adequate financial resources and the participation of all stakeholders are essential in this regard.”

India – II (18 October)
“India welcomes the outcome of the Fifth Review Conference of the CCW held in 2016, including the decision to establish an open-ended Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) related to emerging technologies in the area of Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWs) in the context of the objectives and purposes of the Convention. We look forward to a good discussion at the GGE in November, which should lay the ground for further progress. A continued substantive mandate, adequate financial resources and the participation of all stakeholders are essential in this regard.”

Ireland (9 October)
“With respect to the challenges posed by increasing autonomy in weapons systems my Delegation is of the view that the Group of Governmental Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems should develop a working definition and discuss the application of and compliance with International Humanitarian Law, in accordance with the recommendations of the 2016 Group of Experts and the mandate of the CCW Review Conference.”

Ireland – II (20 October)
“We are encouraged by the active consideration which has been given to the question of lethal Autonomous Weapons systems at the CCW. We look forward to the meeting of the Group of Governmental Experts which should take as its starting point the recommendations of the 2016 Experts Group and the mandate of the Review Conference.”

Japan (18 October)
“We recognize the growing interest in the international community regarding the issue of Lethal Autonomous Weapon Systems (LAWs). Since the 1st informal expert meeting in 2013, there have been some positive results on this issue, but there are still many technological, military, legal, and ethical questions to consider. In this regard, we welcome the decision of the 5th CCW Review Conference to convene the open-ended Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) on LAWS in 2017.
Despite the cancellation of the LAWS GGE scheduled in August, which is regrettable, we have to intensify the discussions and address some of the challenges at the GGE in November in order to achieve substantial progress.”

**Kazakhstan (9 October)**
“We welcome the decision at the Fifth CCW Review Conference to establish the Open-Ended GGE on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS). We intend to take an active part in the November GGE meeting in Geneva.”

**Lebanon (4 October)**
“There’s also a need to determine the linkages with issues such as nuclear safety, autonomous lethal weapons, and the network systems through which drones operate. In this context, it is as well important to duly consider the ethical, legal, and humanitarian concerns raised by drones.”

**Myanmar (10 October)**
“In light of technology advancement, security issues that warrant our serious consideration include Prevention of an Arms race in Outer Space-PAROS, Cyber Security and Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems.”

**Myanmar – II (20 October)**
“We welcome the group of government experts on lethal autonomous weapon systems, established by the Fifth Review Conference.”

**Netherlands (3 October)**
“The international debate about the complicated subject of autonomous weapon systems is multifaceted. It is, however, crucial for future global security. We therefore regret the cancellation of the first meeting of the Group of Governmental Experts [on lethal autonomous weapons systems] under the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons. This debate should not suffer from more delays and therefore we call upon all stakeholders to actively participate in the upcoming GGE meeting in November this year.”

**Netherlands – II (18 October)**
“We welcome the establishment of a Group of Governmental Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapon Systems as a next step in the ongoing deliberations on this topic. We regret that the first week of the GGE could not take place, due to a lack of funding. We hope, however, that the progress made during the three previous Expert Meetings will provide a good basis for structured discussions. The Netherlands will, as before, actively participate in the discussions and further contribute by submitting working papers.”

**New Zealand (20 October)**
“It is a matter of considerable regret that the late- and non-payment of assessed contributions under the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) has constrained that body from holding the meetings agreed upon at the successful Review Conference last year. New Zealand looks forward to the meeting of the open-ended Group of Governmental Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems taking place next month in Geneva and hopes that real progress can be made towards identifying and addressing the challenges that such systems pose for IHL.”
Norway (18 October)
“New and fast evolving technologies for conventional weapons may pose new dilemmas and raise a number of legal and ethical questions. For example, there are already discussions about lethal autonomous weapons systems, and in particular, about whether such weapons systems, once activated, will be able to select and engage targets without further human intervention. These questions will have to be pursued within the CCW. As new weapons technology continues to be developed, it is absolutely necessary to ensure that the basic rules and principles of international law are upheld.”.

Pakistan (10 October)
“Pakistan also supports the commencement of negotiations in the CD on the Prevention of an Arms Race in Outer Space and Negative Security Assurances, as well as on contemporary issues such as chemical and biological terrorism, lethal autonomous weapon systems (LAWS), and cyber weapons.”

Pakistan – II (23 October)
“The development of Lethal Autonomous Weapon Systems (LAWS) has emerged as a major cause of concern for the international community. Any weapon system that delegates life and death decisions to machines, is by nature unethical, and cannot fully comply with international law including International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights Law. LAWS gravely threaten international and regional peace and security as they lower the threshold of war. They would also negatively affect progress on arms control, non-proliferation and disarmament. Their likely proliferation to nonstate actors and terrorists adds another dangerous dimension to their existence. Developments in the field of Artificial Intelligence need to be appropriately tackled and regulated. They should not outpace the evolution of regulations governing them. In view of the illegal, unethical, inhumane and unaccountable nature of LAWS, Pakistan has consistently called for a pre-emptive prohibition on their further development and use. States currently developing such weapons should place an immediate moratorium on their production and meaningfully engage with the international community in addressing their concerns. Pakistan presided over the Fifth CCW Review Conference held in Geneva in December 2016, which provided a useful opportunity to take stock of the Convention and resulted in a forward looking outcome document. Pakistan supported the establishment of an open-ended GGE related to emerging technologies in the area of LAWS in the context of the objectives and purposes of the Convention and looks forward to the detailed consideration of this issue by the GGE. At the same time, we remain open to addressing this issue in other relevant multilateral fora including the Conference on Disarmament.”

Philippines (3 October)
“In today’s world, new technologies are developed almost by the minute. It poses an immense challenge to the disarmament community when such technologies are weaponized. The UN must address these emerging challenges by developing new instruments and frameworks that encompass them and contain the threats they pose. We wish to cite in particular the important work of UNIDIR in disarmament education, especially on emerging security issues relating to autonomous weapons systems and cybersecurity.”

Portugal (9 October)
“On new and emerging threats, such as armed drones, autonomous weapons, cyberspace and militarization of outer space, we should encourage transparency and adapt applicable international law or develop new regulatory multilateral security frameworks responsive to the objective of protecting civilians and Human Rights.”

**Russia (20 October)**

“The Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) is of great importance for the modern world that features a unique balanced account of both humanitarian concerns and legitimate defense interests of States. Russia fully implements its obligations under the CCW. We consistently call for strengthening and globalization of the CCW and its Protocols. We are satisfied with the outcome of the Fifth CCW Review Conference, which confirmed that the Convention remains an effective instrument of international law in the area of control on certain types of conventional weapons. Despite some radical calls, the realistic approach of the State Parties prevailed and it was reflected in the final documents. Any new arrangements within the framework of the CCW can be elaborated only through hard expert work on a balanced basis and provided that those will not undermine the time-tested core CCW provisions. Therefore, we are not rather enthusiastic with regard to the discussion on quite a premature topic of “lethal autonomous weapon systems” (LAWS). The work of the GGE on LAWS should be based on the principles of phased advancement without any attempts to accelerate the progress and definitely without attempts to impose preventive limitations or prohibitions on this type of prospective weapons and relevant technologies.” – *Original statement in Russian.*

**Slovenia (10 October)**

“Slovenia supports the efforts to universalise the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW), which remains one of the leading instruments in the field of conventional weapons. Slovenia supports the decision to debate and make steps forward related to the regulation of the emerging field of Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) in the Group of Governmental Experts (GGE), and looks forward to the meeting of the group in November.”

**South Africa (20 October)**

“South Africa reaffirms its commitment to the Certain Conventional Weapons Convention (CCW) and the humanitarian principles enshrined in the Convention. We attach great importance to this framework Convention evidenced in our ratification of all Protocols annexed to the Convention. South Africa welcomes the outcomes of the Fifth Review Conference of the CCW that took place in December 2016 particularly the decision to convene a Meeting of the High Contracting Parties to the Convention, and to establish an open-ended Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) to discuss emerging technologies in the area of lethal autonomous weapons systems (LAWS). It is, however, a great concern that some CCW meetings for 2017 were unable to convene due to financial constraints. South Africa, therefore, encourages States that have not met their obligations with regard to assessed contributions to do so to ensure effective implementation and participation in future meetings.”

**South Korea (18 October)**

“Third, the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) has played an instrumental role in bringing together states with various legitimate security concerns by taking into account both principles of International Humanitarian Law and military necessity in a balanced manner. A total
of 124 countries have joined the CCW and we welcome the recent accession of Lebanon and Afghanistan. The CCW, with its flexible modular and structure, has been able to address the humanitarian impact caused by conventional weapons, while keeping the discussion within the CCW framework. We welcome the establishment of the Open-ended Governmental Group of Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons (LAWS GGE) … The 5th Review conference of the CCW last year provided us with a truly important opportunity to take stock of our achievement and to set up the future work for the next five-year Review cycle. It was highly commendable to have adopted the final document by consensus. Without undermining these significant achievements, my delegation cannot neglect pointing out that the important meetings decided in the Review Conference have not been convened this year due to the poor financial situation of the CCW. We have to find a way to generate the financial capability in the operational process of the CCW as soon as possible.”

**Switzerland (5 October)**

“Technological developments are also presenting numerous challenges within the field of conventional weapons. This applies for example, to autonomous weapons systems. We regret the fact that the Group of Governmental Experts established by the CCW was not able to hold its first session this year because of financial arrears, and hope that the session planned for next month will enable progress to be made with this dossier. However, the challenges presented by the speed and the scale of technological developments are not limited to autonomous weapons systems. Advances in the areas of artificial intelligence, 3D printing, and within the field of nanotechnologies – to cite only three examples – also raise important questions for the disarmament community.” – Official translation

**Switzerland (18 October)**

“The 5th Review Conference of the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) was especially fruitful. It is now important to ensure progress is made with the implementation of the decisions taken at this event. The cancellation for financial reasons of the first session of the Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) on lethal autonomous weapons systems is regrettable, but it should also prompt the High Contracting Parties to focus their discussions in November on concrete results. Two aspects should be given special attention: first, to reaffirm the applicability of international law as well as to spell out how international law provisions apply to autonomous weapons, and to define measures to strengthen and promote compliance. Second, to elaborate a working definition. It seems essential to us that the GGE bases its work on the outcome of the informal meetings and the key concepts identified during these meetings. The CCW meeting in November will discuss for the first time the challenges presented by scientific and technological advances. While such advances are generally beneficial for our societies, they can also lead to new means and methods of warfare. We welcome the fact that the CCW will discuss the need for dialogue on this subject.” – Official translation

**United Kingdom (18 October)**

“Just as the UK works hard to repair the legacy of past conflicts, we are ready and willing to discuss potential future challenges. The UK attaches great importance to the UN Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) and underscores the importance of universalisation and full implementation of its restrictions I prohibitions to prevent further harm to civilians. The Convention plays a key role in bringing together states with differing national security needs and
concerns and in balancing military necessity with humanitarian concerns. Hence, the CCW is the right forum to continue to respect and reinforce the principles of International Humanitarian Law. As Chair of the Convention this year, the UK will do its utmost to ensure a successful and forward leaning outcome at the meeting of High Contracting Parties in November. Turning now to Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems. The UK believes that LAWS do not and may never exist and, under our definition, any such system would fall foul of IHL. However, we recognise the need for this discussion. The CCW has a crucial role to play in this regard, given its wealth of technical, military and diplomatic expertise. We support the mandate given by CCW to the GGE on LAWS and look forward to further discussions in November.”

United States (18 October)
“The United States is a High Contracting Party to the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) and all of its Protocols. We view the CCW as an important instrument that has brought together States with diverse national security concerns. We are deeply disappointed that a lack of funding has prevented High Contracting Parties from convening all the meetings scheduled for 2017, pursuant to the decisions of the Fifth CCW Review Conference, in December 2016. In particular, we have lost the opportunity to continue our expert discussions on improvised explosive devices under CCW Amended Protocol II, and had to reduce the length of the planned Group of Government Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems from 10 to 5 days. We encourage all High Contracting Parties to pay their share of the assessed costs in a timely fashion to ensure that we can continue this important work.”

European Union (18 October)
“The EU supports efforts to universalise and strengthen the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW). We welcome the successful outcome of the Fifth Review Conference and look forward to further substantive work and discussions. The EU supported the decision at the Fifth Review Conference of the CCW to establish a Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS). Regrettably, outstanding financial contributions by some States prevented the GGE from undertaking its task earlier this year. In our view, the GGE, in accordance with its mandate, should enable discussion on a range of issues including a working definition of LAWS, and the application of, and compliance with International Humanitarian Law, taking into account that such fully autonomous systems do not exist at the moment. Without prejudice to its outcome, the work in the GGE could pave the way for identifying possible best practices and policy guidelines.”

Non-Aligned Movement delivered by Indonesia (2 October)
“NAM is of the view that Lethal Autonomous Weapon Systems (LAWS) raise a number of ethical, legal, moral and technical, as well as international peace and security related questions which should be thoroughly deliberated and examined in the context of conformity to international law including international humanitarian law and international human rights law. NAM States Parties to CCW support the establishment of an open-ended Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) related to emerging technologies in the area of Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems in the context of the objectives and purposes of the Convention. NAM States Parties to CCW welcome Pakistan’s leadership as president of the fifth Review Conference of the Convention held in December 2016 in Geneva.”
**Nordic Countries delivered by Norway (2 October)**

“New and rapidly evolving technologies, also in the military sphere, will have an impact on human and collective security. One aspect that merits further consideration relates to human control over new weapons. We look forward to substantive discussions on challenges in this context, including lethal autonomous weapons systems, at the upcoming Group of Government Experts in the framework of the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons.”

**Nordic Countries delivered by Finland (18 October)**

“We also remain strongly committed to the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons and its Protocols. We are very pleased that a Group of Governmental Experts on lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems will begin its work next month under the able chairmanship of India. The Nordic countries believe that humans should always bear the ultimate responsibility when dealing with questions of life and death. We urge all States to use the GGE as an opportunity to engage in a concrete dialogue on the obligations we all face when assessing the use of new weapons, means and methods of warfare.”

**International Committee of the Red Cross (10 October)**

“It is undisputed that any new technology of warfare must be capable of being used, and must be used, in strict compliance with IHL. However, the challenges for IHL compliance raised by autonomous weapon systems and cyber capabilities — and more fundamentally their profound implications for the future of warfare — lend urgency to international debates on these new means of warfare in particular. In the last three years, CCW expert meetings on “lethal” autonomous weapon systems have identified many of the humanitarian, legal and ethical issues raised by these weapons. Discussions in the CCW have shown broad agreement among States that human control must be retained over weapon systems and the use of force. Indeed, the framework of human control provides a necessary baseline from which common understandings can be developed among States. The forthcoming CCW Group of Governmental Experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapon Systems chaired by India presents the opportunity to consider in more depth where the limits on autonomy in weapon systems must be established to ensure IHL compliance and to satisfy ethical concerns. The ICRC urges all States to seize this opportunity.”

**Campaign to Stop Killer Robots (10 October)**

“We call on states to pursue a revised mandate at the CCW’s annual meeting on 22–24 November 2017 that continues the Group of Governmental Experts and requires that it meet for at least four weeks in 2018 to lay the groundwork necessary to negotiate a new CCW protocol on lethal autonomous weapons systems. The window for preventative action is fast closing. The CCW process on lethal autonomous weapon systems could and should result in a new CCW protocol banning these weapons, but it should not take many years to do so. A long, drawn-out process that achieves a weak or no result must be avoided. Permitting machines to take a human life on the battlefield or in policing, border control, and other circumstances is a moral line that should never be crossed. We state ready to work with states who share this concern and our objective of securing a preemptive ban on fully autonomous weapons now, before it is too late.” – Extract
Annex III: Campaign Delegation

Convention on Conventional Weapons
CCW Group of Governmental Experts on lethal autonomous weapons systems
Geneva
13-17 November 2017

Please also follow: https://twitter.com/BanKillerRobots/lists/ccw-november-2017

Campaign to Stop Killer Robots, @bankillerrobots
Ms. Mary Wareham – Head of CCW Delegation, @marywareham
Prof. Toby Walsh, University of New South Wales, @TobyWalsh

Amnesty International, @amnesty
Ms. Ara Marcen Naval
Mr. Patrick Wilcken

Article 36, @article36
Mr. Richard Moyes, @rjmoyes
Ms. Laura Boillot, @lauraboillot
Ms. Maya Brehm, @schoggigitaler
Ms. Anna de Courcy Wheeler
Mr. Paddy Walker

Association for Aid and Relief Japan, @aarjapan
Mr. Yuki Sakurai

Facing Finance, @FacingFinance
Mr. Thomas Küchenmeister
Ms. Vanessa Müller

Human Rights Watch, @hrw
Mr. Steve Goose
Ms. Bonnie Docherty
Ms. Alicia Brudney, Harvard Law School International Human Rights Clinic
Ms. Sofia Falzoni, Harvard Law School International Human Rights Clinic

International Committee for Robot Arms Control, @icracnet
Prof. Noel Sharkey, @NoelSharkey
Dr. Jürgen Altmann
Dr. Peter Asaro, @peterasaro
Prof. Denise Garcia, @DeniseGarcia100
Dr. Thompson Chengeta, @DrThompsonLaw
Dr. Frank Sauer, Member

Mines Action Canada, @MinesActionCan
Ms. Erin Hunt, @erinlynnhunt

Nobel Women’s Initiative, @NobelWomen
Ms. Jody Williams, Chair & Nobel Peace Laureate, @JodyWilliams97

Norwegian Peace Foundation, @Fredslaget
Mr. Alexander Harang, @AlexanderHarang
Ms. Lene Grimstad, Bjørknes University College in Oslo

Pax Christi Vlaanderen, @paxchristiVL
Mr. Willem Staes, Policy Officer for Security and Disarmament, @willemstaes.

PAX, @PAXforpeace
Ms. Miriam Struyk, @MiriamStruyk
Mr. Daan Kayser, @DaanKayser
Mr. Frank Slijper, @FrankSlijper

Project Ploughshares, @ploughshares_ca
Ms. Branka Marijan, @brankamarijan

Protection
Mr. Ayman Sorour, @aymansorour

Pugwash Conferences on Science and World Affairs, @PugwashConf
Mr. Richard Guthrie

SEHLAC
Mr. Camilo Serna, @SehlacOrg

Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, @WILPF RCW_
Ms. Ray Acheson, @achesonray

# # #
Annex IV: CCW Media Coverage

On behalf of the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots, Human Rights Watch intern Jacob Ware has collected the following list of media articles relating to the November 2017 CCW meetings on lethal autonomous weapons systems. There were at least 369 articles in outlets around the world, including The Washington Post, The Hindu, and Le Temps. Many articles were in English (161), but there was also significant coverage in Spanish (58), German (55), French (31), Arabic (17), Portuguese (12), Chinese (11), Dutch/Flemish (10), Russian (9), Danish (3), and Norwegian (2). The following compilation reflects print coverage and does not capture all radio and television coverage.

English - in chronological order


- This AFP story was also published in Voice of America, Economic Times, Seeker, The News, Arab Times, and Phys.org


- Also published in *The Gulf Today*


“‘Robots are not taking over the world’: UN panel meets to define ‘killer robot’ threat (VIDEO),” RT, 18 November 2017. https://www.rt.com/news/410270-killer-robots-un-meeting/


Other languages
French:

http://www.larecherche.fr/chronique-%C3%A9thique/moratoire-sur-les-robots-tueurs-bonne-conscience-et-mauvaise-foi
http://www.20minutes.fr/sciences/2174791-20171124-armes-autonomes-faut-craindre-robots-tueurs
https://siegeldigital.fr/2017/11/22/video-mise-en-service-drones-tueurs/
https://www.24heures.ch/monde/geneve-avantgarde-combat-robots-tueurs/story/31176933
http://www.lapresse.ca/international/201711/14/01-5143453-les-robots-tueurs-prochaine-arme-de-destruction-massive.php
http://www.notretemps.com/high-tech/actualites/l-onu-va-ouvrir-de-premieres-afp-201711,i156501
http://www.medias-presse.info/mobilisation-scientifique-contre-les-robots-tueurs/83421/
http://www.tdg.ch/reflexions/cybergouvernance-svp/story/27001684
https://www.presse-citron.net/des-mini-drones-tueurs-qui-sement-la-panique-dans-la-population-cauchemar-ou-réalité/
https://usbeketrical.com/article/video-robots-tueurs-interdiction

German:

http://derstandard.at/2000068137922/Slaughterbots-Kurzfilm-warnt-vor-autonomen-Killerrobotern
http://macazin.de/un-beherberg-diskussion-ueber-ki-in-der-kriegsfuehrung/2936
http://www.deutschlandfunk.de/autonome-waffensysteme-beherbergt-zukunft.976.de.html?dram:article_id=400800
http://www.dw.com/de/moralisches-dilemma-tötungsroboter/a-41372768
http://www.dw.com/de/reglementierung-von-killer-robotern-1%C3%A4sst-auf-sich-warten/a-41430412
http://www.krone.at/598671
http://www.maz-online.de/News/Nachrichten/Politik/Weltherrschaft-durch-Maschinen
http://www.sn-online.de/Nachrichten/Politik/Deutschland-Weltweit/UN-Staaten-rechnen-nicht-mit-Verbot-der-Killerrobotern
http://www.sueddeutsche.de/digital/un-beratung-sollen-killerroboter-verboten-werden-1.3747281
http://www.sueddeutsche.de/kultur/autonome-waffen-killerroboter-als-killer-1.3747593?reduced=true
http://www.tagesspiegel.de/politik/killerroboter-die-dritte-revolution-der-kriegsfuehrung/20577372.html
http://www.tagesspiegel.de/politik/killerroboter-und-co-wie-gefaehrlich-ist-kuenstliche-intelligenz/20602292.html
http://www.taz.de/15465304/
http://www.waz-online.de/Nachrichten/Politik/Deutschland-Welt/UN-Staaten-rechnen-nicht-mit-Verbot-von-Killerrobotern
https://de.sputniknews.com/zeitungen/20171120318366346-killerroboter-auf-un-szene/
https://vrodo.de/dystopischer-sci-fi-kurzfilm-zeigt-bedrohung-durch-ki-waffen/
https://vrodo.de/kuenstliche-intelligenz-die-mehrheit-der-deutschen-fuerchtet-die-killer-ki/
https://www.derstandard.de/story/2000067734104/uno-beraet-ueber-killerroboter-im-militaerischen-einsatz
https://www.jungewelt.de/artikel/322202.wer-stoppt-die-killerroboter.html
https://www.springerprofessional.de/roboter/kuenstliche-intelligenz/wenn-ki-kampfroboter-gewissenhaft-toeten/15176070
https://www.watson.ch/International/Wissen/797509523-Horror-Szenario-%C3%8CBSlaughterbots%C2%BB--So-dramatisch-warnen-Forscher-vor-autonomen-Kampfrobotern
https://www.wolfenbuettel.de/zeitung.de/verbraucher/article212539777/Kurzfilm-Slaughterbots-warnt-vor-autonomen-Kampfrobotern.html
https://www.zdf.de/nachrichten/heute/forscher-will-mehr-sicherheit-sorge-ueber-kuenstliche-intelligenz-100.html
https://www.wired.de/collection/science/krieg-im-jahr-2040

Norwegian:
https://radio.nrk.no/serie/dagsnytt/NPUB25031717/13-11-2017#t=59s
https://www.nrk.no/urix/fn-starter-arbeidet-med-a-forby__drapsroboter__1.13775082

Portuguese:
https://br.sputniknews.com/ciencia_tecnologia/201711259928254-robos-inteligencia-artificial-guerra-assassinos/
http://www.bbc.com/portuguese/geral-40997536
https://istoe.com.br/aumenta-a-pressao-para-que-onu-regulamente-sistemas-de-arams-autonomos/

Russian:
https://hightech.fm/2017/11/14/killer-robots
https://hightech.fm/2017/11/16/killer_robots_ban_campaign
https://robotics.ua/news/business/6555-oon_gotova_k_peregovoram_pro_robotov_ubijc
https://sap-bux.pro/articles/63/64/
http://inforos.ru/ru/?module=news&action=view&id=56338
https://www.kommersant.ru/doc/3467291
http://www.unmultimedia.org/radio/russian/archives/259245/#.WiGAoI

Spanish:
https://www.xataka.com/robotica-e-ia/los-investigadores-de-ai-presionan-a-sus-gobiernos-para-que-prohiban-la-creacion-de-robots-asesinos
http://buscandolaverdad.es/2017/11/15/robots-asesinos/
http://es.euronews.com/2017/11/24/droneasesinos-una-distopia-futurista-mas-real-de-lo-que-pensamos
http://www.dineroenimagen.com/2017-11-20/93153
http://www.eltiempo.com/tecnosfera/novedades-tecnologia/primera-reunion-de-comite-de-ouno-sobre-armas-lecales-autonomas-152498
http://www.milenio.com/tendencias/robots_asesinos-ona-control-armas_letales-autonomas_0_1068493249.html
http://www.unPLAY.com/aunclic/la-ona-discutira-el-futuro-de-los-robots-asesinos/
http://www.tynmagazine.com/la-guerra-de-las-armas-letales-autonomas-el-principio-del-fin/
http://https://diariohoy.net/interes-general/la-argentina-se-opone-al-uso-de-armas-autonomas
https://laprensa.peru.com/defensa/noticia-armas-guerra-robots-asesinos-que-son-comunidad-internacional-76241
https://mundo.sputniknews.com/tecnologia/201711251074253076-drones-asesinos-errores/
http://https://nmas1.org/news/2017/11/14/drones-
https://www.canaltr3ce.co/robots-asesinos-lo-planea-la-ona/
https://https://diarioregistrado.com/ciencia-y-tecnica/la-comunidad-internacional-advierte-sobre-los-peligros-de-los-robots-asesinos__a5a099d99469c062c48783fd
https://www.unocero.com/noticias/los-programadores-contra-los-robots-asesinos/