Report on Activities

Convention on Conventional Weapons Fifth Review Conference
United Nations Geneva
12-16 December 2016
# Table of Contents

About this report ................................................................................................................................. 1

Overview ............................................................................................................................................... 1
  1. Agreement on future work ........................................................................................................ 2
  2. Lead-up to the CCW Fifth Review Conference ................................................................. 3
  3. Work of the CCW Fifth Review Conference ..................................................................... 4
  4. Campaign activities ............................................................................................................... 5

Annex I: Country Views on Killer Robots ................................................................................... 9

Annex II: 2016 UNGA First Committee Round-Up ............................................................... 13

Annex III: Campaign Delegation List ....................................................................................... 21

Annex IV: Media Coverage ...................................................................................................... 23
About this report

This Campaign to Stop Killer Robots report details activities undertaken by the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots at the Fifth Review Conference of the Convention on Conventional Weapons (CCW) held at the United Nations in Geneva on 12-16 December 2016. It reviews governments’ participation to the meeting and records the campaign’s contributions.

Campaign coordinator Mary Wareham of Human Rights Watch prepared this report, drawing from statements posted online by the CCW implementation support unit and WILPF’s Reaching Critical Will Project, as well as from notes of the deliberations taken by Bonnie Docherty of Human Rights Watch and her students Joseph Crupi and Anna Khalfaoui at Harvard Law School’s International Human Rights Clinic. Human Rights Watch intern Christopher Diamond compiled the extracts of statements made at UNGA First Committee in October 2016.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots is grateful for the generous support provided by its donors, which enabled us to have a strong presence at the CCW Review Conference and to conduct outreach in the lead-up.

This report is available on the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots website at: www.stopkillerrobots.org

Washington DC
1 February 2017
Overview

1. Agreement on future work

At the Convention on Conventional Weapons (CCW) Fifth Review Conference nations agreed to formalize their process of deliberations on killer robots and dedicate more time to meet in 2017. The decision is contained in the final report of the meeting adopted late in the afternoon on 16 December 2016:

Decision 1

To establish an open-ended Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) related to emerging technologies in the area of lethal autonomous weapons systems (LAWS) in the context of the objectives and purposes of the Convention, which shall meet for a period of ten days in 2017, adhering to the agreed recommendations contained in document CCW/CONF.V/2, and to submit a report to the 2017 Meeting of the High Contracting Parties to the Convention consistent with those recommendations.

The GGE will hold its first session from 24 to 28 April 2017\(^1\) or from 21 to 25 August 2017,\(^2\) and its second session from 13 to 17 November 2017 in Geneva.

The GGE will be chaired by Ambassador Amandeep Singh Gill of India.

\(2\) In case the meeting scheduled for 24-28 April 2017 could not be convened.

The substantive topics that the Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) will discuss can be found in the recommendations issued by the third CCW meeting on lethal autonomous weapons systems held in April 2016 and chaired by Germany’s Ambassador Michael Biontino.\(^1\) At the Fifth Review Conference, nations adopted those recommendations, including the proposal to create the GGE, and agreed on dates for the GGE work in 2017 as well as its chair.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots has welcomed the decision by states to formalize CCW deliberations on fully autonomous weapons in 2017 as it “brings the world another step closer towards a prohibition on the weapons.”\(^2\) The decision continues a process at the CCW that began in November 2013 and demonstrates progress by elevating it to the next level from which negotiations can begin at any point. Past Groups of Governmental Experts have led to negotiations of new CCW protocols, most notably the 1995 CCW Protocol IV that preemptively banned blinding lasers.

---

\(^1\) “Recommendations to the 2016 Review Conference Submitted by the Chairperson of the Informal Meeting of Experts.” 

\(^2\) Campaign to Stop Killer Robots, “Formal talks should lead to killer robots ban,” 16 December 2016. 
https://www.stopkillerrobots.org/2016/12/formal-talks/
The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots set and achieved four core objectives for the CCW Review Conference:

1. We advocated for the recommendation to create the GGE and urged states to request more time than the 4-5 days per year allocated to their informal meetings on the topic during 2014-2016;
2. We reached out to countries in an effort to increase the number of ban supporters, and the group of nations calling for a preemptive ban on fully autonomous weapons expanded to 19 states during the week of the Review Conference with the additions of Argentina, Guatemala, Panama, Peru, and Venezuela;
3. We talked with delegations about how to address concerns over fully autonomous weapons in other fora and at the national level, including by meeting with Agnes Callamard, the new UN Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions, to discuss her role and that of the Human Rights Council;
4. We issued publications and undertook media outreach to draw public attention to the Review Conference and its anticipated decision on killer robots, attracting significant media coverage (See Annex IV).

This report details activities by the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots since April 2016, covering the period leading-up to and during the CCW Review Conference. It references country views and positions while the annexes list country views, UNGA extracts, our Review Conference delegation and media coverage.

2. Lead-up to the CCW Fifth Review Conference

At the CCW’s annual meeting in November 2015, states appointed Ambassador Tehmina Janjua of Pakistan to serve as president of the CCW’s Fifth Review Conference. States also invited the third informal meeting of the CCW on killer robots in April 2016 to draft recommendations for actions that the Review Conference could take on lethal autonomous weapons systems. At the April 2016 meeting states subsequently agreed on set of recommendations proposing that states continue and formalize the deliberations on killer robots by creating a Group of Governmental Experts to explore a list of substantive topics. They left questions about the timeframe for the GGE’s work and its chair for states to decide at the Review Conference.

From 31 August to 2 September 2016, Ambassador Janjua convened a meeting at the UN in Geneva to prepare for the Fifth Review Conference. Almost 90 countries attended along with UN agencies, the ICRC, Human Rights Watch, and WILPF representatives for the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots. The preparatory meeting aimed to consider both substantive and procedural aspects of the Review Conference. Ambassador Janjua laid out her plan to divide the work of the meeting between two committees, proposing Ambassador Tudor Ulianovschi of Republic of Moldova to chair Main Committee II on killer robots with Ambassador Alice Guitton of France as its vice-chair, and Ambassador Matthew Rowland to chair Main Committee I on all topics other than killer robots.

At the preparatory meeting Ambassador Janjua invited states to provide their views on the proposed Group of Governmental Experts, its focus and output, as well as the timeframe for when

---

3 Ambassador Janjua’s role was historic in that she was the first woman to chair a CCW Review Conference and the first representative of a Non-Aligned Movement (NAM) state to do so.
it should meet in 2017 and its possible chair. The majority that spoke expressed their support for the April 2016 recommendations, but few indicated their position on the necessary timeframe or its possible chair. After the preparatory meeting, Ulianovschi and Guitton held extensive consultations to follow-up on these questions in the lead-up to the Review Conference.

In 2016, for the fourth year in a row, concerns over killer robots figured prominently at the UN General Assembly (UNGA) First Committee on Disarmament and International Security in New York, which ran through October and concluded on 2 November. A total of 36 states addressed killer robots in their statements to the 2016 session of UNGA First Committee (See Annex II). Most expressed their support for the April recommendation to create a Group of Governmental Experts. During the 2016 UNGA First Committee, the campaign held a side event briefing with Pakistan, and met with the UN disarmament chief as well as delegations such as France.

3. Work of the CCW Fifth Review Conference

The Review Conference opened with remarks from the UN Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon delivered by Michael Møller, Director-General of the UN Office at Geneva. The rest of the first day of the Review Conference was taken up with a general debate featuring statements by 57 countries, the European Union, NAM (delivered by Venezuela), UN agencies, the ICRC, World Council of Churches, and six NGO co-founders of the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots.4

The next afternoon (13 December), Ambassador Ulianovschi convened Main Committee II to discuss the proposed CCW mandate on lethal autonomous weapons systems in 2017. Germany’s Ambassador Michael Biontino presented his 12-page chair’s report of the third informal CCW meeting on lethal autonomous weapons systems held in April 2016.5 Then 31 states provided their views in addition to the European Union, UNIDIR, ICRC, and the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots.6

All countries that addressed killer robots in the general debate and/or in Main Committee II, except the Russian Federation, expressed their explicit support for the recommendation to establish a Group of Governmental Experts on lethal autonomous weapons systems. Russia objected to every statement by H.E. Michael Biontino Ambassador Permanent Representative of Germany to the Conference on Disarmament on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems, Geneva, 13 December 2016.

http://www.unog.ch/80256EDD006B8954/Attachments/97043403171925A7C125808B00368CEF/file/2016+Bertos


WS_2016_AdvancedVersion.pdf

4 These countries spoke in the general debate: Algeria, Argentina, Australia, Austria, Belarus, Belgium, Brazil, Bulgaria, Cambodia, Cameroon, Canada, Chile, China, Colombia, Costa Rica, Croatia, Cuba, Ecuador, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Holy See, India, Iraq, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Japan, Kuwait, Lao PDR, Latvia, Lithuania, Mexico, Montenegro, Netherlands, New Zealand, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Panama, Peru, Philippines, Republic of Korea, Republic of Moldova, Russia, Slovakia, Slovenia, South Africa, Spain, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, Ukraine, UK, and US.


http://www.unog.ch/80256EDD006B8954/Attachments/97043403171925A7C125808B00368CEF/file/2016+Bertos


WS_2016_AdvancedVersion.pdf

6 Algeria, Argentina, China, Colombia, Costa Rica, Croatia, Cuba, Ecuador, Egypt, El Salvador, Finland, France, Guatemala, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Japan, Netherlands, New Zealand, Nicaragua, Peru, Poland, Republic of Korea, Republic of Moldova, Russia, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, UK, US, and Venezuela.
proposal to take action on various issues of concern at the Review Conference, with one exception, and instead proposed that states focus on CCW universalization and implementation.7

Switzerland presented a joint statement endorsed by eight states that emphasizes compliance with existing international law.8 The campaign viewed its reference to discussing best practices and appropriate technical standards as insufficient, unless the best practice is a ban and the standards are no development, production, and use.

During the general debate Argentina, Panama, and Peru expressed their support for the call to ban lethal autonomous weapons systems, while Guatemala and Venezuela did so on 13 December. This brought the number of states supporting this objective to 19, demonstrating clear momentum towards the ban objective (See Annex I). Many states affirmed the need to retain human control of weapons systems, specifically over the selection of targets and use of force. During the Review Conference a total of seven states elaborated their views on fully autonomous weapons for the first time.9

On the afternoon of 16 December, states convened to adopt the final report of the meeting, which contained the proposed mandate to establish the Group of Governmental Experts when the final report of the meeting was adopted by consensus. At the CCW there is a saying that “nothing is agreed until everything is agreed.” Russia opposed the proposed establishment of a Group of Governmental Experts on killer robots until the president sought to gavel through the decision. It then made a conciliatory statement that said it still views a GGE as unnecessary, but would abstain on the decision.10 The decision was then adopted.

4. Campaign activities

After the April 2016 meeting, the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots continued and intensified outreach aimed at urging states to agree to the proposed recommendation to establish a GGE and urging that more time be dedicated in 2017.

For the fourth year in a row, the campaign made a statement at UNGA First Committee on Disarmament and International Security, this time challenging states to accept the CCW

---

7 The Review Conference considered proposals to address lethal autonomous weapons systems, mines other than antipersonnel mines (MOTAPM), incendiary weapons, science and technology, and improvised explosive devices (IEDs). Russia said it could only support the initiative to address IED use by non-state armed groups.
8 Brazil, Chile, Finland, the Netherlands, Republic of Korea, South Africa, Sweden.
9 Cameroon, Republic of Moldova, Montenegro, Panama, Peru, Slovakia, and Slovenia. See Annex I for the full list.
10 The CCW president asked if states had any comments on the draft mandate. Russia was the only country to speak. It said: “The Russian principle-based approach to the discussion of issues relating to future lethal autonomous weapons systems remains unchanged. As in the past we continue to be convinced that the formalization of such discussions within the framework of our convention would be premature and unlikely to bring significant added value. At the same time, as you all know, it is not in the traditions of Russian foreign policy to block any multilateral discussions in the area of arms control, which do not in a direct fashion undermine the military defense capacity of the Russian Federation. Therefore, the delegation of the Russian Federation at this forum and subsequently will simply abstain from making any statement against the open-ended Group of Governmental Experts on lethal autonomous weapons systems.” See CCW audio recording, 15 December 2016. 
recommendations and work for a preemptive ban. During First Committee, campaigners met with UN disarmament chief Kim Won-soo, as well as with country delegations including France, Germany, and the US. The campaign held a steering committee meeting at the New School on 14 October. Campaigners attended a presentation by ICRAC’s Peter Asaro at an “Ethics in Artificial Intelligence” conference at New York University. Campaign coordinator Mary Wareham provided an update on recent activities to activists attending the annual Humanitarian Disarmament Forum.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots held a side event briefing for UNGA First Committee delegates on 18 October 2016 that representatives from at least ten states attended. Matthew Bolton from ICRAC facilitated the briefing, which featured remarks by Ambassador Janjua as president of the CCW Review Conference. Artificial intelligence expert Professor Stuart Russell of UC Berkeley, Steve Goose of Human Rights Watch, and campaign coordinator Mary Wareham also made presentations. At least six participants asked questions, including Russia, which was participating for the first time in a campaign side event briefing at UNGA.

Several parliamentary initiatives took place in the lead-up to the CCW Review Conference. On 8 December, Representative Jim McGovern and eight other House Democrats sent a letter to the US secretaries of defense and state that expressed their support for a preemptive ban on fully autonomous weapons and requested the US pursue a new CCW protocol to “require meaningful human control over target selection and engagement for each individual attack.” In Belgium, a parliamentarian tabled a resolution on 12 December asking the government to prohibit fully autonomous weapons and pursue the adoption of an international ban treaty.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots delegation to the Review Conference consisted of more than two-dozen representatives from Canada, Colombia, Egypt, Japan, the Netherlands, South Africa, Switzerland, UK, and the US (See Annex III). Campaign to Stop Killer Robots representatives met several times with Ambassador Janjua and her team in the lead-up to the Review Conference.

---

12 Canada, Cuba, France, Holy See, Ireland, the Netherlands, Pakistan, Russia, South Africa, and the US. The ICRC, UN Disarmament and other agencies, and various NGOs also participated.
13 Russia’s representative spoke second, reading from a written statement that we recorded as follows: “We express our gratitude for holding this briefing and for mentioning the recent meeting in Moscow. There is no reason to move to a develop a ban protocol. We are open to dialogue. There are differences between how states and NGOs view the issue of options for future work. We are skeptical, but we listen and discuss at inter-agency meetings.”
14 Letter from Representatives Jim McGovern (D-MA), Barbara Lee (D-CA), Chris Van Hollen (D-MD), Alan Grayson (D-FL), Mark Pocan (D-WI), John Conyers (D-MI), John Lewis (D-GA), Raul Grijalva (D-AZ), and Maxine Waters (D-CA) to Secretary of State John Kerry and Secretary of Defense Ash Carter, 8 December 2016. http://mcgovern.house.gov/sites/mcgovern.house.gov/files/Letter%20to%20Kerry%2C%20Carter%20on%20Lethal%20Autonomous%20Weapons.pdf
15 The resolution calls on the Federal Government to “1. Actively and urgently participate in the international multilateral discussions on fully autonomous weapons, and during the review conferences of the Convention on Conventional Weapons to call for the start of negotiations aimed at creating an additional protocol within the Convention for a pre-emptive ban on the development, production and use of fully autonomous weapons. 2. Install a complete national ban on the development, production and use of fully autonomous weapons, and in this way prevent that the offices of Defence, Justice, Internal Affairs would have these weapons at their disposal.” It defines fully autonomous weapons as weapons that can independently select and attack targets without meaningful human intervention. The resolution is available in Dutch and French from http://www.dekamer.be/FLWB/PDF/54/2219/54K2219001.pdf
During the Review Conference they met with Ambassador Janjua as well as with Ambassador Amandeep Singh Gill of India and his team just before he was accepted to chair the new CCW Group of Governmental Experts in 2017. Campaigners met with a number of country delegations including Australia, China, France, Japan, Republic of Moldova, Netherlands, Russia, Sri Lanka, UK, and the US.

Members of the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots released several new publications for distribution at the Review Conference. Human Rights Watch published a 49-page report by senior arms researcher Bonnie Docherty rebutting 16 key legal, technical, policy, and security arguments against banning fully autonomous weapons. SEHLAC, the regional humanitarian disarmament security network that joined the campaign’s Steering Committee in April 2016, published a 10-page Spanish-language briefing paper. Heather Roff from Arizona State University published an 8-page memo for the CCW delegates on meaningful human control of weapons systems as part of a research project by Roff and Richard Moyes of Article 36, supported by the Future of Life Institute.

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots convened two side event briefings during the Review Conference. One looked at why existing law, weapons reviews and best practices are not enough to address the challenges raised by fully autonomous weapons systems. Facilitated by Thompson Chengeta, the newest member of ICRAC, this briefing featured legal experts Bonnie Docherty of Human Rights Watch, Maya Brehm from the Geneva Academy of International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights, and Peter Herby from the Norwegian Red Cross. The other briefing looked at why a ban on fully autonomous weapons is needed now. Facilitated by ICRAC’s Frank Sauer, the briefing featured remarks by Nobel Peace Laureate Jody Williams, artificial intelligence expert Professor Toby Walsh, Jonathan Freirich of the World Council of Churches, and campaign coordinator Mary Wareham.

On 13 December, Jody Williams and Mary Wareham met with Michael Møller, head of the UN Office in Geneva, who described Williams as “one of my heroes.” Møller requested the meeting as he wanted to see how the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots is placing pressure on states to move faster and aim higher for a CCW outcome on killer robots, especially to increase public understanding and support in national capitals. The campaign has written to the new UN Secretary-General Antonio Gueterres to request his support and forwarded the sign-on letters from artificial intelligence (AI) experts, Nobel Peace Laureates, and faith leaders calling for a preemptive ban on fully autonomous weapons.

On behalf of the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots, Williams and Wareham addressed a media briefing hosted by the Committee of the Association of Correspondents Accredited to the United Nations (ACANU), providing background on the CCW Review Conference and the campaign’s call to action. Approximately a dozen journalists attended from media including AFP, EFE, NHK, Yomiri Shimbum, PAX News Agency, and various Swiss/Geneva-based outlets. (See Annex IV) Campaign co-founder WILPF’s Reaching Critical Will published six editions of its CCW Report newsletter for distribution to CCW delegates.

The campaign published a web post when the CCW Review Conference concluded and an end-of-year wrap up shortly after.

For more information, please see:
- CCW Fifth Review Conference website and audio recordings
- WILPF Reaching Critical Will CCW website
- Campaign to Stop Killer Robots website and Flickr site (for photos)
Annex I: Country Views on Killer Robots
13 December 2016

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots monitors developments with respect to national policy to address concerns over fully autonomous weapons, including positions on the call to ban these weapons.

Who wants to ban on killer robots?

Nineteen countries are calling for a ban on lethal autonomous weapons systems

In alphabetical order:

1. Algeria
2. Argentina
3. Bolivia
4. Chile
5. Costa Rica
6. Cuba
7. Ecuador
8. Egypt
9. Ghana
10. Guatemala
11. Holy See
12. Mexico
13. Nicaragua
14. Pakistan
15. Panama
16. Peru
17. State of Palestine
18. Venezuela
19. Zimbabwe

In chronological order:
- Pakistan on [30 May 2013]
- Ecuador on [13 May 2014]
- Egypt on [13 May 2014]
- Holy See on [13 May 2014]
- Cuba on [16 May 2014]
- Ghana on [16 April 2015]
- Bolivia on 17 April 2015
- State of Palestine on 13 November 2015
- Zimbabwe on [12 November 2015]
- Algeria on [11 April 2016]
- Costa Rica on [11 April 2016]
Who has spoken on the topic of killer robots?


1. Algeria on 30 May 2013
2. Argentina on 30 May 2013
3. Australia on 14 November 2013
4. Austria on 30 May 2013
5. Bangladesh on 21 October 2016
6. Belarus on 14 November 2013
7. Belgium on 11 November 2013
8. Bolivia on 17 April 2015
10. Brazil on 30 May 2013
11. Bulgaria on 23 October 2014
12. Cameroon on 12 December 2016
13. Canada on 11 November 2013
14. Chile on 13 April 2015
15. China on 30 May 2013
16. Colombia on 17 April 2015
17. Costa Rica on 29 October 2013
18. Croatia on 15 November 2013
19. Cuba on 30 May 2013
20. Czech Republic on 13 May 2014
21. Denmark on 13 April 2015
22. Ecuador on 29 October 2013
23. Egypt on 30 May 2013
24. Estonia on 31 August 2016
25. Finland on 22 October 2014
26. France on 30 May 2013
27. Germany on 30 May 2013
28. Ghana on 14 November 2013
29. Greece on 29 October 2013
30. Guatemala on 16 May 2014
31. Holy See on 14 November 2013
32. Hungary on 7 October 2016
33. India on 30 October 2013
34. Indonesia on 30 May 2013
35. Iran on 30 May 2013
36. Iraq on 13 November 2015
37. Ireland on 29 October 2013
38. Israel on 15 November 2013
39. Italy on 14 November 2013
40. Japan on 29 October 2013
41. Kazakhstan on 13 November 2015
42. Kuwait on 26 October 2015
43. Latvia on 21 October 2016
44. Lebanon on 26 October 2015
45. Lithuania on 14 November 2013
46. Madagascar on 14 November 2013
47. Mali on 13 May 2014
48. Mexico on 30 May 2013
49. Moldova, Rep. on 12 December 2016
50. Montenegro on 12 December 2016
51. Morocco on 30 May 2013
52. Netherlands on 29 October 2013
53. New Zealand on 30 October 2013
54. Nicaragua on 13 November 2015
55. Norway on 13 May 2014
56. Pakistan on 30 May 2013
57. Palestine on 13 November 2014
58. Panama on 12 December 2016
59. Peru on 12 December 2016
60. Philippines on 14 April 2016
61. Poland on 13 April 2015
62. Romania on 26 October 2015
63. Russia on 30 May 2013
64. Sierra Leone on 30 May 2013
65. Slovakia on 12 December 2016
66. Slovenia on 12 December 2016
67. South Africa on 30 October 2013
68. South Korea on 14 November 2013
69. Spain on 11 November 2013
70. Sri Lanka on 13 April 2015
71. Sweden on 30 May 2013
72. Switzerland on 30 May 2013
73. Turkey on 14 November 2013
74. Ukraine on 14 November 2013
75. United Kingdom on 30 May 2013
76. United States on 30 May 2013
77. Zambia on 17 April 2015
78. Zimbabwe on 12 November 2015
Annex II: 2016 UNGA First Committee Round-Up
October 2016

In October 2016, 36 countries provided their views on killer robots during the annual session of the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) First Committee on Disarmament and International Security: Austria, Bangladesh, Botswana, Canada, China, Costa Rica, Croatia, Cuba, Czech Republic, Ecuador, Finland, France, Germany, Hungary, India, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Japan, Latvia, Lebanon, Mexico, Netherlands, New Zealand, Pakistan, Poland, Portugal, Russia, South Africa, South Korea, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, United Kingdom, and United States. The extracts follow.

This compares to 32 countries that articulated their views on killer robots at UNGA First Committee in 2015, 23 in 2014, and 16 in 2013. Most countries raised killer robots in their remarks to the general debate or conventional weapons debate.

At 2016 UNGA First Committee three countries—Bangladesh, Hungary, and Latvia—expressed their views on fully autonomous weapons for the first time. Most countries that spoke endorsed the proposed GGE while Russia was the most skeptical, indicating it has “major doubts.” Cuba, Costa Rica, Ecuador, and Pakistan again expressed their strong support for the call to ban fully autonomous weapons while Croatia and South Africa urged the retention of human control of weapons systems.

Extracts on killer robots from statements to 2016 UNGA First Committee

**Austria, 4 October 2016**
Another matter of concern for my country is the prospect of the development of lethal autonomous weapons systems. Technological progress is fast and what seems futuristic today may be a reality tomorrow. The challenge is how to ensure that developments remain within ethical, political and legal imperatives. We welcome the broad discussions which were held on the occasion of a series of expert meetings in the framework of the Conventional Weapons Convention. We support the recommendation issued by the latest of those meetings that the forthcoming Review Conference of the Conventional Weapons Convention should establish a Group of Governmental Experts to further deepen and intensify international debate on the issue.

**Austria, 21 October 2016**
Mr. Chairman, Before I conclude, let me put on record here one more concern of my country. This is the prospect of development of lethal autonomous weapons systems. With technological innovation moving fast, we risk crossing a very dangerous threshold soon. We should be very careful to make sure that the application of such technologies is consistent with ethical, political and legal imperatives. Therefore, we are in favour of deepening and intensifying the on-going international debate about lethal autonomous weapons systems.

**Bangladesh, 21 October 2016**
The Fifth Review Conference of the CCW in December has the opportunity to advance the dialogue on international legal and regulatory framework on certain advanced convention weapons pursuant to the Convention's objectives and purposes. Bangladesh looks forward to constructive
discussions on the recommendations made concerning lethal autonomous weapons system (LAWS) by the informal meeting of experts held in April.

**Botswana, 21 October 2016**

Furthermore, recent technological developments such as the use of unmanned air vehicles, drones and autonomous weapons further complicate this matter. While recognizing the strategic and operational requirements for such weaponry, we hold a view that there is a need for serious and sober interrogation on the employment of these. The established body of public international law such as International Humanitarian law amongst others should guide and inform such discourse.

**Canada, 24 October 2016**

In the context of the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons, Canada has been active in the discussions on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS). We support the consensus recommendations of the April 2016 Meeting of Experts on LAWS. Canada stresses the importance of ongoing engagement with civil society, including academics and other experts, in order to ensure a comprehensive understanding of this complex issue.

**China, 10 October 2016**

The process of arms control, disarmament and non-proliferation is at a critical historical stage. The nuclear disarmament process is faltering, the authority of the nuclear non-proliferation regime is being undermined, the existing disarmament mechanism is faced with challenges, rules and norms on the emerging strategic frontiers such as outer space, cyberspace and autonomous weapons are yet to be put in place, and the basis for global strategic balance and stability is getting eroded.

**China, 21 October 2016**

In recent years, the humanitarian problems caused by Lethal Autonomous Weapons (LAWS) received growing attention. China supports continued and in-depth discussion on the issue under the appropriate arms control framework, so that countries could gradually deepen understanding, reach consensus, to jointly address the challenges caused by LAWS.

**Costa Rica, 4 October 2016**

Las armas autónomas letales pueden poner en entredicho los equilibrios regionales, y afectar los progresos generales alcanzados en la esfera del desarme y la no proliferación. Somos del criterio que estas armas deberían prohibirse antes de que lleguen a construirse, de la misma forma que se hizo con los láseres cegadores. Por ello, creemos conveniente que la próxima Conferencia de Revision estudie la posibilidad de convocar una reunión de expertos gubernamentales que pueda identificar elementos necesarios para elaborar una convención internacional.

**Costa Rica, 20 October 2016**

Costa Rica expects the Fifth Review Conference of the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons address the ethical concerns, legal and technical that they have been raised since 2013 regarding lethal autonomous weapons systems, which are in our view, contrary to international humanitarian law and international law of human rights. Therefore, we will advocate for the next Review Conference will convene an open-ended group of governmental experts to identify the elements necessary to advance an international convention banning this type of new technologies of conventional weapons.
Croatia, 21 October 2016
Informal discussions on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) have been taking place within the CCW for the last three years”. Based on these discussions we now have a better understanding of lethal autonomous weapons systems; yet many unanswered questions remain, including those that raise fundamental ethical, legal, operational, technical and political concerns. For Croatia, a key question is whether these new technologies would be compliant with the rules of IHL, including those of distinction, proportionality, and military necessity, as well as their potential impact on human rights and compliance with International Human Rights Law (IHRL). The principle of "meaningful human control" is of pivotal importance because we believe that the ultimate responsibility should ley in human hands.

Cuba, 20 October 2016
In the world, increasingly sophisticated and deadly conventional weapons are produced. There is a marked imbalance in favor of developed countries in terms of production, possession, and trade in these weapons, which threatens stability, international security and peace.

Some states that are leaders in manufacturing, modernization, employment, and development of conventional weapons of high destructive capacity, try to impose regulations to limit and hinder acquisition and employment of other nations for legitimate defense purposes, with certain types of less significant conventional and light weapons.

We support the adoption of a binding instrument prohibiting fully autonomous lethal weapons systems, even before we see them brought into use. Similarly, regulations are necessary for the use of arms that are somewhat autonomous, maintaining the possibility of a human driver intervention.

The development of autonomous systems involving lethal weapons, would at a minimum, pose a serious risk in compliance with the rules and principles of International Humanitarian Law.

Czech Republic, 21 October 2016
The Czech Republic reiterates its strong support for the Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Which May Be Deemed to Be Excessively Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate Effects (CCW) that regulates the conduct of armed conflict and thus constitutes an essential part of international humanitarian law. Universality of the CCW and its Protocols remains one of the highest priorities of the Czech Republic. We look forward to the Fifth Review Conference taking place in December this year and believe in progress in discussions and even decisions on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) and possibly on Mines other than anti-personnel mines (MOTAPM).

Ecuador, 4 October 2016
My country also expresses concern at the increasing use and advancement and improvement of the UAVs and gunships as autonomous lethal weapons. The use of these new military technologies brings serious concerns humanitarian, moral and legal order, international community in its various regional and universal forums should continue deepening the implications for international humanitarian law, foreseeing even prohibition of such weapons. We support both work in the
framework of the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons in this regard and we believe that the regulation only his International trade is not enough.

**Finland, 21 October 2016**
The Fifth Review Conference of the CCW will provide an opportunity to continue to address both long standing and newly emerging issues. It is important that the CCW lives up to the developments in the field of conventional arms. Finland strongly supports the recommendations made by the expert group on lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS), including, the establishment of a Group of Governmental Experts under the auspices of the CCW.

**France, 4 October 2016**
Regarding the CCW, the lively debates on the main subjects on its agenda are encouraging. It is particularly positive to see that the question of lethal autonomous weapons systems, raised by France in 2013, is gradually reaching maturity. [We hope that a group of governmental experts will be created at the December Review Conference to continue discussions on this subject.]

**Germany, 21 October 2016**
The CCW’s work on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) has been extremely useful over the past three years. We would like to see a continuation of our common effort in this area. The next step will be to endorse the informal Group of Expert’s recommendations at the Fifth Review Conference. The proposed mandate by the experts captures the complex nature of the problem in its legal, technical and ethical dimension. We think it is possible to arrive at a common understanding and chart a way forward in this ambitious undertaking.

We hope that the recommendations will be formally endorsed by the High Contracting Parties at the Review Conference and that this will lead to the establishment of a formal Group of Governmental Experts in 2017.

**Hungary, 7 October 2016**
The CCW is a unique and important tool to assert and enforce the norms of International Humanitarian Law (IHL) in the field of disarmament and non-proliferation. The CCW and its Protocols play an important role in responding to challenges posed by new technologies and adapting international disarmament norms to new situations. In this context, Hungary welcomes substantial consideration of the issues of Improvised Explosive Devices (IEDs), Lethal Autonomous Weapon Systems (LAWS) and Mines Other Than Anti-Personnel Mines in the current review cycle, and we support the continuation of these discussions after the Fifth Review Conference this December.

**India, 20 October 2016**
The CCW should continue considering ways and means for progressive development of the rules of international law applicable to advanced conventional weapons which have devastating and indiscriminate effects. In this context, we support continued discussions on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) in the CCW, on the basis of the mandate agreed at the Meeting of Experts on LAWS in April, consistent with the objectives and purposes of the Convention. We feel that LAWS should be assessed not just from the view point of their compatibility with
international law including international humanitarian law but also their impact on international security if there is dissemination of such weapon systems.

**Ireland, 7 October 2016**  
In particular, we are encouraged by the active consideration which has been given to the question of Lethal Autonomous Weapons systems at the CCW and welcome the consensus recommendations which were adopted at the meeting of experts last April. Ireland believes it would now be timely for the Review Conference to establish a group of Governmental experts to take this important work forward.

**Israel, 20 October 2016**  
Israel welcomes the work undertaken this year in the CCW and is looking forward to the 5th Review Conference to be held in December 2016. There are some issues that are due to be discussed, such as the IEDs, MOT APM and especially LAWS which need to be further explored, from both technical and legal aspects. We believe the Review Conference would be an opportunity to engage in meaningful and substantive discussions and Israel is committed to doing so.

**Italy, 5 October 2016**  
In the field of conventional weapons, we look forward to the Review Conference of the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons to take stock of the work conducted in the past five years, and to lay the basis for our efforts in the next intersessional cycle, particularly as relates to the issues of Improvised Explosive Devices and Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems.

**Japan, 6 October 2016**  
With the view of the 5th CCW Review Conference to be held this December, having recognized the growing interest of the international community in the issue of Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS), Japan welcomes the recommendation of the 3rd Informal Meeting of Experts and supports discussing this issue further in order to deepen our common understanding on the main elements, including identification of characteristics, elaboration of a working definition of LAWS and application of international law.

**Latvia, 21 October 2016**  
Latvia remains firmly committed to the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons and its Protocols. We regard CCW as an important forum to increase awareness of the existing challenges and to address emerging issues by gathering competent diplomatic, legal and military expertise. In this regard, we appreciate continued discussions on improvised explosive devices and lethal autonomous weapons systems. We hope that at The Fifth Review Conference in December this year we will be able to agree on the next steps to effectively take these discussions further.

**Lebanon, 5 October 2016**  
With regard to new challenges such as armed drones, autonomous weapons, cyber-security and outer space activities, Lebanon reaffirms the need to regulate the use of such technologies in a universal and inclusive manner based on the principles of Human rights and International Humanitarian Law.

**Mexico, 20 October 2016**
With the intention to contribute to the progressive development of international law, Mexico promotes actions within the framework of the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons to discuss the ethical and technical dilemmas of new technologies. Mexico hoped that the Fifth Review Conference (Geneva, December 2016) emanating proposal to allow the CCAC provide shared solutions to major challenges facing the international humanitarian community.

**Netherlands, 6 October 2016**

The Netherlands greatly values the important international discussion about autonomous weapon systems. We therefore strongly call for the establishment of an open-ended Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) under the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) as next step in these discussions. The increasing availability of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles, armed and unarmed, not only to states but also to non-state actors, is of concern to us. Regarding non-state actors, we see an increased risk for UAV proliferation amongst terrorist organisations such as ISIS. The existing international legal framework applies to the use of armed drones. However, it is of utmost importance that existing laws are being upheld and increased transparency is being provided on export and usage. The Netherlands remains committed to an open international dialogue on this matter in order to guarantee transparent and responsible use.

**New Zealand, 21 October 2016**

New Zealand retains its support, in principle, for the framework approach of the CCW. We would particularly hope that the outcome of this year’s Review Conference will position the Convention to remain relevant and responsive to contemporary concerns, including on the issues of incendiary weapons; Mines Other than Anti-Personnel Mines; and Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS). With respect to LAWS in particular we must not allow protracted discussions about the modalities of the process to dictate or limit the substantive progress that is necessary bearing in mind the legal, technical and moral challenges posed by these weapons.

**Pakistan, 10 October 2016**

The existing and emerging challenges to arms control, non-proliferation and disarmament need to be tackled collectively on the basis of cooperative multilateralism. The fundamental prerequisites for global security need to be appropriately addressed, including:

….. bringing under appropriate international regulations and prohibitions the development and use of cyber weapons, armed drones and Lethal Autonomous Weapon Systems (LAWS).

**Poland, 4 October 2016**

We appreciate the possibility offered by the CCW to address threats resulting from both existing conventional weapons and emerging technologies, such as lethal autonomous weapons systems. In regard to the latter we look appreciatively at progress made so far and hope to see a further formalization of discussion, including through establishment of the Group of Governmental Experts at the CCW Fifth Review Conference.

**Portugal, 6 October 2016**

As new challenges emerge, we should consider how the existing disarmament and non-proliferation instruments can be improved. On current and future developments related to the so-called “new era warfare tools”, notably armed drones, fully autonomous weapons, cyberspace offensive use and militarization of outer space, we encourage the continuation of ongoing
international work on these subjects, both at political and technical levels. These discussions should take into account, in our view, the need to promote transparency and the applicable international law or, when needed, the establishment of regulatory multilateral security frameworks responsive to the objective of protecting civilians and Human Rights.

**Russia, 20 October 2016**

Overall, we support the initiatives to consider on the platform of the CCW questions having to do with the emergence of new types of conventional weapons. At the same time, we believe that this would be beneficial only when we have developed a clear understanding of the subject of discussion. Therefore, we still have major doubts regarding the advisability of establishing a group of government experts on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems. It’s no secret to anybody that the results of the last three rounds of informal discussions on this could not be called encouraging. However, we will be prepared to discuss this and other themes that will be included on the agenda of the two main committees of the review conference.

**South Africa, 20 October 2016**

While artificial intelligence and robotics present both challenges and opportunities, we should always be mindful that the possibility to weaponise such technology raises fundamental ethical, legal, operational, and political questions. South Africa believes that the principles of IHL apply to the use of all weapons in any conflict situation, including Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS). We support the recommendations to the Review Conference for the convening of a group of governmental experts to discuss LAWS, which would deepen our understanding of the degree of human oversight or control that "autonomous weapons" require.

**South Korea, 7 October 2016**

The Republic of Korea also welcomes the recommendations of the global meeting of experts on LAWS… We believe that the CCW framework is the most appropriate to further discuss LAWS, which is to strike the necessary balances between humanitarian concerns and security requirements.

**Sri Lanka, 24 October 2016**

In this context, we welcome the on-going discussions on Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS) under the CCW framework. Sri Lanka particularly welcomes the outcome of the 2016 Meeting of Experts on LAWS, which agreed on a set of recommendations, as per the mandate agreed to at the 2015 Meeting of High Contracting Parties to the Convention, which Sri Lanka had the privilege to Chair. We hope that the recommendation for establishment of a Group of Governmental Experts (GGE) to discuss LAWS in 2017 would attract a favourable consideration by State Parties at the upcoming 5th Review Conference later this year.

**Sweden, 4 October 2016**

Sweden remains firmly committed to the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons and its protocols. Sweden very much appreciates the discussions held on lethal autonomous weapon systems. As States we have an obligation to assess the legality of new weapons. Sweden will support a decision to create, at the Review Conference, a Group of Governmental Experts to examine this issue further.
Switzerland, *5 October 2016*
We believe that it is important for the disarmament community to pay particular attention to this issue. We welcome the fact that the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons has actively taken up the issue of lethal autonomous weapons systems, and hope that its next Review Conference will set up a group of governmental experts with a strong mandate to advance work in this area. We also deem vital that the monitoring or review of scientific developments be taken up by the various disarmament processes, as is already the case for the CWC. To examine the impact of new technologies on international security and disarmament in greater detail, Switzerland will be holding a side event on 6 October together with UNIDIR, the James Martin Centre and the UN Office for Disarmament Affairs.

Turkey, *11 October 2016*
We expect that the Fifth Review Conference of CCW in December will consider the discussions we have had in the last five-year cycle and also prepare the basis for the next intersessional cycle, particularly on issues such as Improvised Explosive Devices (IEDs) and Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS). We welcome the adoption of a political declaration on IEDs.

Turkey, *24 October 2016*
We expect that the Fifth Review Conference of CCW in December considers the discussions we have had in the last five-year cycle, and also prepare the basis for the next intersessional cycle, particularly on issues such as Improvised Explosive Devices (IEDs) and Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems (LAWS). We wish to add that we welcome the adoption of a political declaration on IEDs. We support the furthering of the work on LAWS. CCW is the right forum to take up LAWS, as it seeks a balance among humanitarian actions and military utility.

United Kingdom, *20 October 2016*
Just as its aid focuses on repairing the legacy of past conflicts, the United Kingdom is ready and willing to discuss potential future challenges. For that reason, the United Kingdom took part in the productive informal meeting of experts on lethal autonomous weapons systems in April this year at the UN Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW). We thank Germany, and Ambassador Biontino in particular, for once again leading discussions; and support the recommendations to the Review Conference. We also thank the ICRC for hosting an experts meeting in March this year, which allowed states to explore further the challenges of increasing autonomy.

United States, *20 October 2016*
Mr. Chairman, the United States is a High Contracting Party to the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (CCW) and all of its Protocols. We view the CCW as an important instrument that has been responsible for bringing together States with diverse national security concerns. In 2016, the High Contracting Parties continued important discussions on improvised explosive devices and Lethal Autonomous Weapons Systems. We look forward to continuing these discussions at the Fifth CCW Review Conference in December.
Annex III: Campaign Delegation List

Convention on Conventional Weapons Fifth Review Conference
Geneva
12-16 December 2016

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots delegation to the CCW’s Fifth Review Conference is comprised approximately 30 campaigners from a dozen member NGOs based in countries including Canada, Colombia, Egypt, Germany, Japan, the Netherlands, South Africa, Switzerland, UK, and the US. Women accounted for half of the campaign delegation.

Campaign to Stop Killer Robots
Ms. Mary Wareham – Head of CCW Delegation
Dr. Heather Roff
Prof. Toby Walsh, University of NSW

Article 36
Ms. Elizabeth Minor
Mr. Richard Moyes
Mr. Patrick Walker
Ms. Lucy Smith

Association for Aid and Relief, Japan
Ms. Natsuki Matsumoto

Facing Finance
Mr. Thomas Küchenmeister
Ms. Natalie Hentschel

Human Rights Watch
Mr. Steve Goose
Ms. Bonnie Docherty
Mr. Mark Hiznay
Mr. Joseph Crupi, Harvard Law School International Human Rights Clinic
Ms. Anna Khalfàoui, Harvard Law School International Human Rights Clinic

International Committee for Robot Arms Control
Dr. Frank Sauer
Mr. Thompson Chengeta

 Mines Action Canada
Ms. Erin Hunt

Nobel Women’s Initiative
Ms. Jody Williams

**PAX (formerly IKV Pax Christi)**
Ms. Miriam Struyk
Mr. Daan Kayser

**Protection**
Mr. Ayman Sorour

**SEHLAC**
Mr. Camilo Serna

**Women's International League for Peace and Freedom**
Ms. Ray Acheson
Ms. Allison Pytlack
Ms. Josephine Roele

#  #  #
Annex IV: Media Coverage

The Campaign to Stop Killer Robots conducted media outreach in the lead-up to the Fifth Review Conference of the Convention on Conventional Weapons, including the August preparatory meeting. Our campaign co-founder Jody Williams, 1997 Nobel Peace Laureate, addressed UN accredited media at a briefing on 13 December together with campaign coordinator Mary Wareham. The Review Conference considered a range of arms issues—not just killer robots—and took place at the same time as then opposition-controlled parts of Aleppo City were falling to Syrian government forces. Therefore, the press coverage was lighter than in previous years (eg no wire stories), but still significant and global in its scope as this compilation shows. Many CCW delegates told us they had read, and enjoyed, the 8,000-word BuzzFeed profile of the Campaign to Stop Killer Robots by Sarah Topal.

Selected articles (in chronological order)

Sarah Topal, “Killer robots are coming and these are the people trying to stop them,” BuzzFeed, 26 August 2016. https://www.buzzfeed.com/sarahatopol/how-to-save-mankind-from-the-new-breed-of-killer-robots


Other languages


[International efforts to stop the "killer robots" before it is too late], Badr News Agency [Outlet in Baghdad, Iraq], 17 December 2016. http://www.badrnews.net/home/single_news/42237


Dutch


French


German


Italian


Japanese

日米、ロボット兵器規制に慎重 国連で来年議論
https://this.kiji.is/180226062210385405?c=110564226228225532

ロボット兵器規制に慎重 日米、国連で来年議論
産経新聞（The Sankei Shimbun）, 10 December 2016.

日米、ロボット兵器規制に慎重 国連で来年議論
http://dd.hokkaido-np.co.jp/news/international/international/1-0347190.html

日米、ロボット兵器規制に慎重 国連で来年議論
https://news.biglobe.ne.jp/international/1210/kyo_161210_8977881921.html

タイムリミットは1年——トランプが握る「ロボット兵器と戦争」の未来
http://wired.jp/2016/12/12/fate-killer-robots/
WIRED, 12 December 2016.
国連、殺人ロボット兵器の禁止に向けた公式な取り組みを進めることを決定
http://www.excite.co.jp/News/it_g/20161218/Slashdot_16_12_18_0529234.html
exciteニュース（excite news）, 18 December 2016.

人工知能の軍事転用 規制めぐる議論、日本がリードを
https://www.komei.or.jp/news/detail/20161221_22464
公明党（Komeito）, 21 December 2016.

中国、ロボット兵器規制を支持 五大国で初めて
http://dd.hokkaido-np.co.jp/news/international/international/1-0351867.html

側近が「国連には従わない」と発言…どうなる!?トランプ次期大統領とキラーロボット
https://roboteer-tokyo.com/archives/7214
Roboteer,inc., 27 December 2016.

特定通常兵器使用禁止制限条約第5回運用検討会議
http://www.mofa.go.jp/mofaj/dns/ca/page3_001931.html

キラーロボットの禁止に向けて 2017年公式会合がスタート
AAR Japan web post, 22 December 2016.

Spanish

See also: